

Limited Repeat and Sectoral PEFA 2013

Trinidad and Tobago

Final Report

Volume 2 - Sectors

January 2014

The contents of this publication are the sole responsibility of **ACE International Consultants** and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Union



Final Report

Project No. 2013/322918/1

By

Mr Ronald Quist and Mr Charles Hegbor

Presented by

ACE, International Consultants (Spain)



CURRENCY AND EXCHANGE RATES

Currency unit = Trinidad and Tobago Dollar (TT\$)

US\$ 1 = TT\$6.29

Euro 1 = TT\$8.85

GOVERNMENT FISCAL YEAR (FY)

1 October – 30th September

PEFA ASSESSMENT PERIOD

FY 2009/2010, FY 2010/2011, FY 2011/2012

TIME OF ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Table of contents

Table of Contents

Acronyms and Abbreviations	7
Integrated Summary Assessment	9
I. Integrated Assessment of PFM Performance	10
A. Credibility of the budget	10
B. Comprehensiveness and transparency	11
C(i). Policy-based budgeting	11
C(ii). Predictability and control in budget execution	12
C(iii). Accounting, recording and reporting	14
C(iv). External scrutiny and audit	14
II. Assessment of the impact of PFM weaknesses	21
1. Aggregate Fiscal Discipline	21
2. Strategic Allocation of Resources	21
3. Efficient Service Delivery	22
1 Introduction	23
1.1 Objective of the PFM-PR	23
1.2 Process of preparing the PFM-PR	23
1.3 Methodology	24
1.4 Scope of the assessment	26
2 Country Background Information	27
3 Assessment of PFM Systems, processes and institutions	29
3.1 Budget credibility	29
3.1.1 PI-1 Aggregate expenditure out-turn compared to original approved budget	29
3.1.2 PI-3 Aggregate revenue out-turn compared to original approved budget	31
3.1.3 PI-4 Stock and monitoring of expenditure payment arrears	33
3.2 Comprehensiveness and transparency	36
3.2.1 PI-5 Classification of the budget	36
3.2.2 PI-7 Extent of unreported government operations	37
3.3 Policy-based budgeting	40
3.3.1 PI-11 Orderliness and participation in the annual budget process	40
3.3.2 PI-12 Multi-year perspective in fiscal planning, expenditure policy and budgeting	44
3.4 Predictability and control in budget execution	48
3.4.1 PI-16 Predictability in the availability of funds for commitment of expenditures	48
3.4.2 PI-17 Recording and management of cash balances, debt and guarantees	51
3.4.3 PI-18 Effectiveness of payroll controls	54
3.4.4 PI-19 Competition, value for money and controls in procurement	57
3.4.5 PI-20 Effectiveness of internal controls for non-salary expenditure	62
3.4.6 PI-21 Effectiveness of internal audit	66
3.5 Accounting, recording and reporting	69
3.5.1 PI-22 Timeliness and regularity of accounts reconciliation	69

3.5.2	PI-23 Availability of information on resources received by service delivery units	71
3.5.3	PI-24 Quality and timeliness of in-year budget reports	72
3.5.4	PI-25 Quality and timeliness of annual financial statements	75
3.6	External scrutiny and audit	78
3.6.1	PI-26 Scope, nature and follow-up of external audit	78
3.7	Donor practices	81
3.7.1	D-2 Financial information provided by donors for budgeting and reporting on project and program aid	81
3.7.2	D-3 Proportion of aid that is managed by use of national procedures	82
Annexes		85
Annex 1: PFM Performance Measurement Framework Indicators Summary: Sectors		87
Annex 2: List of Stakeholders Interviewed		105
Annex 3: List of Documents Consulted		109

Acronyms and Abbreviations

AG	Auditor General
AGA	Autonomous Government Agencies
AO	Accounting Officer
BIR	Board of Inland Revenue
CBTT	Central Bank of Trinidad and Tobago
CF	CF Consolidated Fund
CoA	Chart of Account
CoAs	Comptroller of Accounts
COFOG	Classifications of Functions of Government
CPI	Consumer Price Index
CTB	Centrals Tenders Board
DMFAS	Debt Management and Financial Accountability System
EAA	Exchequer and Audit Act
EU	European Union
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
FY	Fiscal Year
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GFS	Government Financial Statistics
GNI	Gross National Income
GRAP	Generally Recognised Accounting Practice
HDI	Human Development Index
IA	Internal Audit
IADB	Inter-American Development Bank
ICT	Information & Communication Technology
IFMIS	Integrated Financial Management Information System
IHRIS	Integrated Human Resource Information System
IIA	Institute of Internal Auditors
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INTOSAI	International Organisation of Supreme Audit Institutions
LGA	Local Government Authority
MDA	Ministries, Departments and Agencies
MoFE	Ministry of Finance and the Economy
MTEF	Medium Term Expenditure Framework
MTII	
NA	National Assembly
N/A	Not Applicable
NT	National Treasury
ODA	Official Development Assistance
PAC	Public Accounts Committee
PAEC	Public Accounts Enterprises Committee
PE	Public Enterprise
PEFA	Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability
PER	Public Expenditure Review
PETS	Public Expenditure Tracking Survey
PFC	Policy Formulation Committee
PFM	Public Finance Management
PFM	
PMF	Public Finance Management Performance Management Framework
PI	Performance Indicator
PPP	Public Private Partnership
PS	Permanent Secretary
PSIP	Public Sector Investment Program
PU	Procurement Unit
SBS	Sector Budget Support
SCM	Supply Chain Management
SNG	Sub National Government
SoE	State Owned Enterprise

T&T	Trinidad and Tobago
ToR	Terms of Reference
TSA	Treasury Single Account
TTEITI	Trinidad and Tobago Extractive Industry Transparency Initiative
TTTI	Trinidad and Tobago Transparency Initiative
VAT	Value Added Tax
WASA	Water and Sewerage Authority

Integrated Summary Assessment

This assessment of PFM performance of five selected Line Ministries was sponsored by the European Commission. It has been carried out principally to facilitate dialogue to support the improvement of PFM performance in the lead line ministries receiving sector budget support from the European Commission. In particular, the PFM Performance Assessment will support the analysis on the PFM conditionality pertaining to budget support operations. In this study such PFM performance measurement has been applied in the areas of environmental governance, private sector development and diversification from the sugar industry. The specific line ministries receiving budget support under these sectors are Ministry of Food Production (under diversification from the sugar industry), Ministry of Trade Industry & Investment (MTII), Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development (together with MTII under private sector development), Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs and Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources (under environmental governance).

This Sectoral PEFA is the first to be carried out for Trinidad and Tobago and will serve as a benchmark for any future PFM performance assessments, adapting the PEFA methodology, that are applied to these five selected line ministries. Such future PFM performance assessments, carried out every three or four years (preferably in tandem with the central government PEFA Assessment) will provide a basis for monitoring progress over time in PFM performance in these line ministries.

The field mission of the Sectoral PEFA was carried out at the same time as that of the Limited PEFA Assessment applied to the Central Government's PFM operations whose results are presented in Volume I. While the Central Government's Limited PEFA included interviews with the Ministry of Education, The Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Works and Infrastructure to gain an insight into the bottom up elements of the PFM procedures, the PFM assessment of the five line ministries listed above, provided a broader sample of line ministry bottom up perspectives and consequently provided deeper and more confident insights into central government PFM operations. In turn a deeper understanding of the PFM procedures managed by the central coordinating ministries provided further explanation to the results and measures observed in the five selected line ministries.

The adaptation of the PEFA methodology (originally developed to assess central government PFM operations, and subsequently adapted to assess sub-national government PFM operations) takes cognisance of the lack of relevance to a specific line ministry's PFM performance in such measures as budget documentation, debt management, inter-governmental fiscal transfers, public enterprises fiscal oversight, tax revenue administration, accounting standards, external audit and parliamentary oversight. Under some PEFA performance indicators, it was discovered that some but not all sub indicators under a given PEFA performance indicator were found to be relevant. Consequently it was also necessary to modify the scoring calibration method for M2 indicators. The look up table for indicator scores were based upon the number of eligible line ministry performance sub indicators applied rather than on the total number sub-indicators indicated in the PEFA manual. For example, under PI-17, an M2 PEFA Assessment Indicator, only one sub indicator (PI-17(ii)) out of three was found to be relevant to a line ministry's PFM performance assessment, in which case the overall performance indicator score was made equal to the sub indicator score.

I. Integrated Assessment of PFM Performance

In the following sections of the Summary, the performance of PFM systems, procedures and practices as measured through the PEFA method adapted to its application in selected Line Ministries in Trinidad and Tobago, is described. In these sections five line ministries were considered. They are: the Ministry of Food Production (under diversification from the sugar industry), Ministry of Trade Industry & Investment, Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development, and Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs and Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources (under environmental governance). The description is presented under each of six critical dimensions of PFM as defined within the PEFA methodology. These six dimensions are credibility of the budget; comprehensiveness and transparency; policy based budgeting; predictability and control in budget execution; accounting, recording and reporting; and external scrutiny and oversight.

A. Credibility of the budget

Sound performance under the credibility of the budget measure requires credible estimates of revenue and expenditure as well as effective salary and non-salary expenditure controls. The results under this critical dimension are mixed. They demonstrate weaknesses with respect to the revenue estimates versus actual outturns; as well as weaknesses with respect to the match of line ministry original, primary budget estimates versus outturns. In the case of revenue estimates, it appears that this weakness has not drawn much attention because overall (except in the case of the Ministry of Energy) they contribute very small proportions of the overall central government's revenue. Correspondingly, large deviations in the line ministry revenue estimates does not significantly impact upon the credibility of the overall revenue estimates. The Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment measured a slightly higher level of performance than the other line ministries in the revenue estimate measure of performance.

Poor results are recorded under primary line ministry budget expenditure estimates when compared to actual expenditure outturns. The exception was the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs, which scored a B in this particular measure (see PI-1). It should be noted that given the importance of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs to the management of oil and gas revenues, they are not subject to the large level of budget cuts that other line ministries are subjected to.

The PFM systems deliver predictable and well controlled virement procedures with well documented and suitably controlled steps. The low variances up and above the expenditure deviation at the aggregate level would seem to suggest a strong coupling between the budget formulation and preparation process, and in turn between budget estimate and implementation. However, officials point out that neither the recurrent budget nor the development budget are developed within politically backed ceilings provided within the budget call circulars issued at the start of the budget preparation cycle. Without realistic fiscal bounds, development budgets are developed more as a wish list of projects than a carefully top-down disciplined budgetary process of project prioritization. There is some indication that line ministries intentionally bid beyond their requirements in anticipation of large cuts that can be expected at the end of the budget preparation cycle, in the hope that this might lead to a final allocation more closely aligned to the line ministry's actual requirement. Alternatively, it may be that actual budgetary requirements are addressed through a supplementary budget process where additional funds can be released. As it turns out

the Ministry of Finance in recent years has been very strict about introducing significant additional resources through supplementary budget processes. In the case of the recurrent budget (whose largest component is compensation), the budget expenditure estimates are made on the basis of establishment rather than on some reasonable estimate of actual nominal rolls coupled with some estimate of likely funded establishment.

In the case of expenditure arrears management, all five selected line ministries reviewed demonstrated high performance levels. The stock of expenditure arrears are monitored and reported on in the annual financial statements. The expenditure arrears remains less than 2% for all line ministries assessed.

B. Comprehensiveness and transparency

Only two areas under comprehensiveness and transparency of the PFM systems were applicable to a sectoral PEFA assessment. These were the budget classification and the measure regarding extra budgetary fiscal elements. All of the five selected line ministries formulate, implement and report their budgets on economic and administrative classifications. All internally generated funds in the line ministries are reported upon and all expenditure is made through the single treasury account. The exception to this arrangement is the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs that maintain some deposit accounts, from which approximately 15% of their expenditure is made. These amounts arise as a consequence of Production Share Agreements held with Oil and gas producers. The accounts are held with the Central Bank of Trinidad and Tobago and are overseen by the Comptroller of Accounts. The percentage of donor funds that are not reported within the budget is small and pertains to technical assistance elements. Consequently well over 90% of donor funds received by each ministry assessed is reported upon. There are no active Public Private Partnerships in any of the line ministries under review.

C(i). Policy-based budgeting

The line ministries adopt a dual budget process with the recurrent budget process coordinated by the Budget Division within the Ministry of Finance, and the development budget process coordinated through Public Sector Investment Program managed through the Ministry of Planning. The line ministries receive clear policy direction from the cabinet to the budget holders through the budget call circular. The budget call circular is received early in February and negotiations with the Ministry of Planning in the case of the development budget, and the Ministry of Finance in the case of the recurrent budget begin at the beginning of April. However, the lack of cabinet approved budget ceilings dilutes the effectiveness of the bottom-up elements of budget preparation, even though the budget schedule provides ample time for budget holders to prepare their budget. Without definite ceilings it is difficult for line ministries to systematically prioritise programmes and projects. Further, the absence of politically backed ceilings in the budget call circular, has led to some line ministries intentionally bidding considerably higher than their requirements, in anticipation of massive cuts. Consequently, it is difficult to see how carefully considered strategy can survive massive cuts without huge strategic distortion and imbalance. Even if there were careful considerations of life cycle costing – investment plus forward linked recurrent costs – it is unlikely that these relationships could survive such a budgetary process.

The budget process occurs in accordance with a definite budget calendar and is guided by clear and timely budget call circulars that facilitate an early budget preparation process by the budget holders. The Line Ministries have approximately eight weeks to prepare their budget bids. Finalised

ceilings authorised by cabinet are provided towards the end of the budget preparation cycle, allowing approximately a week for Ministries to finalise their budgets with approved bids.

The Medium Term Policy Framework (2011 to 2014) serves as the overarching national development framework from which line ministry strategies and plans are developed. The exception is the Ministry of Environment and Water Resources. It is a new ministry evolved out of the former Ministry of Housing and Water Resources, and is yet to develop a strategy. Line ministry plans and strategies are not developed within realistic fiscal aggregate forecasts nor are they fully costed with both recurrent and capital cost implications taken into account. Coupled with the absence of budget ceilings in the call circular it is unlikely that the linkages between line ministry strategy, budget formulation and budget implementation can be maintained in a meaningful way. This can result in massive readjustments with a subsequent distortion between investment costs and forward linked recurrent costs during planning, budget formulation and implementation of projects.

There are links between the sector development plans and the budget made through annual public sector investment programmes (PSIPs). Links between projects and programs that are entered into the PSIP are justified by the strategies, but the links remain qualitative. All projects included in the PSIP are cabinet approved. They are however not developed within fiscal frames. The inclusion of PSIP projects into the development budget process is not guided by ceilings. Some Line Ministries report that their budget submissions do not specifically include forward linked recurrent costs emanating out of the development projects. However, the Budget Division reports that such costs are estimated and included in the recurrent budgets as part of the reconciliation process. The effectiveness of such an arrangement is not clear since Line Ministries report that they are not made aware of such recurrent budget considerations being made and reflected in the approved budgets.

The emphasis by the Ministry of Finance on maintaining top down discipline serves the fiscal discipline objective well. However, the absence of cabinet approved ceilings from the budget process undermines the bottom up elements of the budget process, and almost certainly impacts negatively the opportunities to achieve both technical and allocative efficiency.

The executive typically completes its budget submissions five to six weeks prior to the start of the fiscal year. The Parliament approves the appropriations prior to the start of the fiscal year after review of the budget proposals except for one of the years under this review. In that year it passed the budget within one month of the start of the fiscal year. The Exchequer and Audit Act allows for continued spending by the line ministries for just the first month of the new fiscal year.

C(ii). Predictability and control in budget execution

Predictability of line ministry budget execution is most directly premised upon the predictability of budget releases received from the Treasury. This is dependent on the line ministries submitting credible pro forma cash flows to the Treasury at the start of the fiscal year, and monthly updates regarding the line ministry budget requirements. This allows the Treasury to reconcile net borrowing profiles and revenue receipts. While line ministry pro forma cash flows are not explicitly based upon procurement plans, they are based upon investment schedules that implicitly incorporate procurement planning considerations. Cash management and debt management are very well managed and facilitate highly predictable budget releases. Trinidad and Tobago uses a

centralised payments system out of the Consolidated Fund. Daily bank balance consolidation informs and guides budget releases.

The five selected line ministries employ a manual system for non-salary expenditure management, accounting and financial reporting. Budget allocation and budget release discipline is strong. Commitment control is effected through the implementation of a Vote Book expenditure control system. It is generally effective, even though there are some informal procurement arrangements bypassing the official arrangement with respect to commitments (issuance of purchase orders, referred to as invoice orders) though not payments. Some weaknesses pertaining to procurement planning and reporting on commitments may contribute to the end of year rush to spend unutilised funds at the close of the year. This in turn may be part of the reason for working around procurement procedures. Civil society elements report that there are substantial payment delays especially towards the end of the fiscal year.

Payroll management in the five selected line ministries is facilitated using a transverse computerised human resource management and payroll system, called Integrated Human Resource Information System (IHRIS). This system directly links three databases: the establishment of posts, the personnel database which serve as control files, and the payroll database. Changes to these databases leave an audit trail and permit only selected access dependent upon function. The databases are encrypted. All civil servants are registered through IHRIS that include appropriate fields to protect against duplication. Effective controls implemented in each of the five line ministries reviewed with respect to the creation of new posts, include budgetary controls, the hiring of new employees (controlled by the posts database), and the assignment of promotions, transfers, allowances and terminations. Further, through the use of verification procedures, exception reports and staff surveys, there is fair assurance of the integrity of the payroll management system.

While effective controls exist for each of the main steps of the expenditure cycle, procurement controls remain less than fully effective in the line ministries for all classes of budget expenditure. For lower volume purchases of goods, works and services the request for quotation method is applied. However, for higher amounts, public procurement is managed by the Central Tenders Board. The legal regulatory requirements do not clearly establish the Central Tenders Board Ordinance to extend to special purpose companies (all of which are state owned enterprises) which operate on their own procurement rules. All of the line ministries reviewed employ special purpose companies to carry out some of their procurement. Expenditure under the Infrastructure Development Fund is implemented through these special purpose companies. This means that a substantial proportion of development expenditure is not subject to public procurement regulations. Further, the line ministries provide no effective independent methods to address administratively public procurement complaints. Civil society elements state their concern for the lack of transparency and competition they experience with procurement carried out by the special purpose companies.

Internal audit in all of the selected line ministries remains rudimentary, and does not focus on systemic issues. The Internal Audit Units elaborate annual audit plans which, when reported on, are not disseminated to the office of the Auditor General or to the Comptroller who serves as the overall coordinator of the internal audit function. However, upon specific requests made by the Auditor General they are provided.

C(iii). Accounting, recording and reporting

All of the five selected line ministries manage all of their expenditure through a single treasury bank account; for which the bank account balances are determined daily. The exception to this arrangement is the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs that as a result of Production Share Agreements with Oil and Gas companies are obligated to operate separate deposit accounts to manage approximately 15% of their expenditure. These deposit accounts are held with the central bank and their operations are overseen by the Comptroller of Accounts. The line ministries do not manage the bank account directly but rather can be characterized as participating in the management of the single treasury account by performing monthly cheque reconciliations which can then be aggregated to facilitate a complete bank reconciliation process by the Treasury. Officials in all line ministries report that advances are never provided and that reconciliation and clearance of suspense accounts take place usually monthly, or at least quarterly.

The government accounting standards are applied across all of the line ministries reviewed.

A standard format for monthly expenditure returns is applied in all five of the line ministries reviewed. The monthly expenditure returns are comprehensive, consistent with the budget classification and structure, and allow direct comparison of budget implementation to the original budget. The reporting format distinguishes commitments and expenditure. In each of the line ministries they are issued within 30 days of the close of the month, which has ensured their timeliness and hence their effectiveness as a management tool.

No reporting on the resources (in cash or in kind) disbursed to the front-line service delivery units are carried out on a routine basis for any of the line ministries reviewed. There have been no Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys (PETS) nor any other special surveys carried out in Trinidad and Tobago; nor are there any planned to be carried out in the near future. The administrative structure of the chart of accounts reflects entities specified to the level of primary schools and health clinics. Therefore, in principle, it should be possible to track and report upon cash and kind resources received by such entities. However, the accounting system being manual would make the reporting on cash and in kind resources a considerable administrative burden.

Consolidated government accounts are prepared annually with revenue and expenditure information as well as a table of financial assets and liabilities. There is also reporting on non-salary expenditure arrears. The line ministries submit financial reports in a timely manner so as to facilitate completion of the aggregate financial statement within four months of the close of the fiscal year.

C(iv). External scrutiny and audit

No comprehensive assessment was made of performance indicators under this critical dimension under the sectoral PEFA apart from PI-26(iii) which assesses the executive follow-up of Auditor General recommendations on line ministries financial statements. Legislative scrutiny is inapplicable to the sector PEFA. Even though the Auditor General offers recommendations on audit findings, executive or management follow-up is weak leading to the re-occurrence of audit findings going forward (PI-26(iii)).

Table 1.0 Overall Summary of PFM Performance Scores - Central Government & Sector PEFA 2013

PFM Performance Indicators			Central Government	Environmental Governance Sector		Private Sector Support		Diversification from sugar production
				MoE & WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
A. PFM-OUT-TURNS: Credibility of the budget								
PI-1	M1	Aggregate expenditure out-turn compared to original approved budget	A	D	B	D	D	D
		Overall rating	A	D	B	D	D	D
PI-3		Aggregate revenue out-turn compared to original approved budget		D	D	D	C	D
	M1	Overall rating		D	D	D	C	D
PI-4	M1	Stock and Monitoring of Expenditure Payment Arrears						
	(i)	Stock of Expenditure Payment Arrears		A	A	A	A	A
	(ii)	Data Availability		B	B	B	B	B
		Overall rating		B+	B+	B+	B+	B+
B. KEY CROSS-CUTTING ISSUES: Comprehensiveness and Transparency								
PI-5	M1	Classification of the budget	C	C	C	C	C	C
		Overall rating	C	C	C	C	C	C
PI-7	M1	Extent of Unreported Government Operations						
	(i)	Level of extra budgetary expenditure (exc. Donor Funds)		A	A	A	A	A
	(ii)	Donor funds included in fiscal reports		A	A	A	A	A
		Overall rating		A	A	A	A	A
C. BUDGET CYCLE								
C(i) Policy-Based Budgeting								
PI-11		Orderliness and Participation in the Annual Budget Process						
	(i) M2	Existence and Adherence to a fixed budget calendar	A	A	A	A	A	A
	(ii)	Clarity/comprehensiveness of and political involvement in budget preparation	D	D	D	D	D	D
	(iii)	Timeliness of budget approval by the legislature	B	B	B	B	B	B
		Overall rating	B	B	B	B	B	B
PI-12		Multi-year perspective in Fiscal Planning, Expenditure Policy and Budgeting						
	(i) M2	Multi-year fiscal forecasts and functional Allocations	C					
	(ii)	Scope and Frequency of Debt Sustainability Analysis	A					
	(iii)	Existence of Costed Sector Strategies	D	D	D	D	D	D
		Linkages between investment budgets and forward expenditure estimates	C	D	D	D	D	D
		Overall rating	C+	D	D	D	D	D

PFM Performance Indicators			Central Government	Environmental Governance Sector		Private Sector Support		Diversification from sugar production
				MoE & WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
C(ii) Predictability and Control in Budget Execution								
PI-16	M1	Predictability in the Availability of Funds for Commitment of Expenditure						
(i)		Extent to which cash flows are forecast and monitored		A	A	A	A	A
(ii)		Reliability and horizon of periodic information to MDAs on commitment ceilings						
(iii)		Frequency and transparency of adjustments to budget allocations						
		Overall rating		A	A	A	A	A
PI-17		Recording and Management of Cash Balances, Debt and Guarantees						
(i)	M2	Quality of debt data recording and reporting						
(ii)		Extent of consolidation of the government's cash balances		A	A	A	A	A
(iii)		Systems for contracting loans and issuance of guarantees						
		Overall rating		A	A	A	A	A
PI-18	M1	Effectiveness of Payroll Controls						
(i)		Degree of integration and reconciliation between personnel records and payroll	A	A	A	A	A	A
(ii)		Timeliness of changes to personnel records and the payroll	B	B	B	B	B	B
(iii)		Internal controls of changes to personnel records and the payroll	A	A	A	A	A	A
(iv)		Existence of payroll audits	C	C	C	C	C	C
		Overall rating	C+	C+	C+	C+	C+	C+
PI-19		Transparency, Competition and Complaints Mechanism in Procurement						
(i)	M2	Transparency, comprehensiveness and competition in legal & regulatory framework	C	C	C	C	C	C
(ii)		Use of competitive procurement methods	D	D	D	D	D	D
(iii)		Public access to complete, reliable and timely procurement information	D	D	D	D	D	D
(iv)		Existence of an independent administrative procurement complaints system	D	D	D	D	D	D
		Overall rating	D	D	D	D	D	D
PI-20		Effectiveness of Internal Controls for Non-salary Expenditure						
(i)	M1	Effectiveness of expenditure commitment controls	B	B	B	B	B	B
(ii)		Comprehensiveness, relevance and understanding of internal controls	C	C	C	C	C	C
(iii)		Degree of compliance with rules for processing and recording transactions	B	C	C	C	C	C
		Overall rating	C+	C+	C+	C+	C+	C+
PI-21	M1	Effectiveness of Internal Audit						
(i)		Coverage and quality of the internal audit function	C	C	C	C	C	C

PFM Performance Indicators			Central Government	Environmental Governance Sector		Private Sector Support		Diversification from sugar production
				MoE & WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
(ii)		Frequency and distribution of reports	C	C	C	C	C	C
(iii)		Extent of management response to internal audit findings	C	C	C	C	C	C
		Overall rating	C	C	C	C	C	C
C(iii) Accounting, Recording and Reporting								
PI-22		Timeliness and Regularity of Accounts Reconciliation						
(i)	M2	Regularity of bank reconciliations		C	C	C	C	C
(ii)		Regularity of reconciliation and clearance of suspense accounts and advances		A	A	A	A	A
		Overall rating		B	B	B	B	B
PI-23	M1	Availability of information on resources received by service delivery units	D	D	D	D	D	D
		Overall rating	D	D	D	D	D	D
PI-24	M1	Quality and Timeliness of in-year budget reports						
(i)		Scope of reports (coverage and compatibility with budget estimates)		A	A	A	A	A
(ii)		Timeliness of the issue of reports		A	A	A	A	A
(iii)		Quality of information		A	A	A	A	A
		Overall rating		A	A	A	A	A
PI-25	M1	Quality and timeliness of annual financial statements						
(i)		Completeness of the financial statements	B	B	B	B	B	B
(ii)		Timeliness of submission of the financial statements	A	A	A	A	A	A
(iii)		Accounting standards used	C					
		Overall rating	C+	B+	B+	B+	B+	B+
C(iv) External Scrutiny and Audit								
PI-26		Scope, nature and follow-up of external audit						
(i)	M1	Scope/nature of audit performed						
(ii)		Timeliness of submission of audit reports to legislature						
(iii)		Evidence of follow up on audit recommendations		C	C	C	C	C
		Overall rating		C	C	C	C	C
D-2		Financial information provided by donors (projects and program aid)						
(i)	M1	Completeness and timeliness of budget estimates by donors for project support	D	D	D	D	D	D
(ii)		Frequency and coverage of reporting by donors on actual donor flows	D	D	D	D	D	D
		Overall rating	D	D	D	D	D	D

PFM Performance Indicators			Central Government	Environmental Governance Sector		Private Sector Support		Diversification from sugar production
				MoE & WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
D-3	M1	Overall proportion of aid funds to central government that are managed through national procedures	A	A	A	A	A	A
		Overall rating	A	A	A	A	A	A

Key:

Not relevant to sector/Not assessed	Overall score

II. Assessment of the impact of PFM weaknesses

When viewed from the perspective of the three main objectives of a sound PFM system, namely aggregate fiscal discipline, strategic allocation of resources and the efficient delivery of services; the line ministries reviewed show mixed results with respect to fiscal discipline. The delayed announcement of budget ceilings only at the end of the budget preparation process has undermined the credibility of the budget estimates as it pertains to expenditure estimates. There is also little credibility with respect to revenue estimates. Expenditure management is strong and there is only a limited accrual of expenditure arrears. The review demonstrates weakness in PFM performance at the level of the line ministries with regard to the strategic allocation of resources.

1. Aggregate Fiscal Discipline

With respect to aggregate fiscal discipline, Trinidad and Tobago achieves fiscal discipline on an aggregate basis. This however does not translate into fiscal discipline being achieved at the line ministry level. The lack of credibility of internally generated revenue forecasts and budget expenditure estimates in line ministries undermine the achievement of fiscal discipline when viewed from the perspective of individual line ministries. The absence of significant levels of unreported government operations, predictable budget releases, effective cash management, effective payroll management, commitment controls, the low accrual of expenditure arrears and effective external audit, all impact positively on the achievement of fiscal discipline from the perspective of the line ministries.

2. Strategic Allocation of Resources

The absence of indicative fiscal aggregates in the process of developing line ministry strategies and plans undermines the likelihood of effectively translating strategic goals through the budget formulation and budget implementation stages. Sustainability, a crucial strategic objective is undermined because little attention is paid to life cycle costing (investment cost plus forward linked recurrent expenditure) in the development of sector programs and projects. Even where these occur it is unlikely that the careful balance between budgeted investments and their related forward linked recurrent charges can be maintained given the massive cuts experienced by Line Ministries through the budget preparation process. Without budget ceilings at the start of the budget preparation process, the Line Ministries have little opportunity to prioritize their programs taking into account such factors as life cycle costing in the preparation of their development budgets.

While there is very strong policy dialogue incorporated into the budget process, the absence of cabinet approved ceilings at the beginning of the budget cycle leaves a vacuum for defining priorities which has led to persistent large mismatches between budget bids and the availability of fiscal resources. The budget classification remains principally economic and administrative and so is not directly capable of supporting a policy based budgeting process and thus the input for achieving the strategic allocation of resources.

Although the development objectives do not rely heavily upon Development Partner inputs, there are missed strategic opportunities that arise due to the lack of a close alignment of development partner program and project grants with the budget process and an almost total absence of timely

reporting on project and programme achievements consolidated into the national consolidated financial reporting framework. Not tracking resources received by front line service delivery units such as primary schools and primary health care facilities (see PI-23) is a missed opportunity to better manage resources. This is coupled with the lack of an effective monitoring and evaluation framework focussed on outputs and outcomes and therefore the achievement of effectiveness in the strategy plans.

3. Efficient Service Delivery

The main opportunity for promoting efficient service delivery within line ministries would be to implement a public procurement system which itself promotes competition. However there remain some difficulties with respect to public procurement. The current legal and regulatory framework for public procurement does exclude a number of opportunities for improving competition in public procurement. There are no requirements to prepare and publish procurement plans; there is no requirement for the implementation of an effective, independent public procurement complaints mechanism and there is no oversight authority to ensure operational adherence to the public procurement procedures. Public procurement is further complicated by the creation of special purpose companies set up as public corporations that are used for procuring goods, works and services for the Line Ministries. These special purpose companies are not required to follow the public procurement laws and regulations.

Significant contributions to efficient service delivery can be made through effective monitoring of transfers to frontline service delivery units to guide policy and inform on the efficiency of service delivery. The financial reporting and tracking systems are not yet able to report regularly on the resources received by service delivery units.

1 Introduction

1.1 Objective of the PFM-PR

The overall objective of the PEFA assessment was to assist in improving the Public Finance Management performance in Trinidad & Tobago for central government and line ministries. The sector assessment was unique in the sense that it was the first of its kind. The methodology and scope of work were carefully crafted to identify the relevant Performance Indicators to the sector assessment, having in mind the inter-linkages between central government and line ministries. The PEFA methodology requires the assessment of 31 high-level performance indicators - 28 for central government and 3 for donors. However, the sector assessment measured 20 high-level indicators - 18 for line ministries and 2 for donors; this was because of the sector-relevance of the performance indicators.

Specifically, the sector PEFA assessment was conducted to fulfil the EU's eligibility criteria for sector budget support. This required the appraisal of PFM systems, processes and procedures adopted in five line ministries selected under the three sectors receiving budget support. The Public Finance Management Performance Review (PFM-PR) uses a rating system of A to D for scoring each indicator - an A meaning a high performance and a D meaning a low performance. In addition to the ratings, a narrative is presented describing and supporting each score and the reasons thereon.

It should be stated that this report is the Volume 2. Volume 1 (Central Government) provides a vivid description of the country context, the legal and regulatory framework, and the institutional framework supporting PFM, which are equally applicable to line ministries.

The sector assessment, going forward, is intended to serve as a common tool for dialogue between development partners on one hand, and the central government and line ministries on the other hand with the participation of civil society organisations. Further, the assessment will serve as a monitoring and evaluation tool for PFM systems and procedures and the sector PFM reform dovetailed into the central government's reform agenda, if any.

The "Strengthened Approach" which required a country/government led assessment, a donor coordination and the availability of a common data pool for PFM reform, has been adopted in this assessment in order that the findings will form the basis for future PFM reforms.

1.2 Process of preparing the PFM-PR

The sector PEFA assessment was carried out as part of the EU's eligibility criteria for sector budget support and fully funded by the European Commission. The Terms of Reference, which was prepared by the EU Delegation to Trinidad and Tobago in consultation with other major donors and the Government as a key stakeholder, requested the screening of three sectors currently receiving budget support namely environmental governance, private sector development support and diversification from sugar production using the PEFA methodology. In view of this, five MDAs were part of the assessment; these were the Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment, the Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development, the Ministry of Food Production, the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs and the Ministry of Environment and Water Resources. A day's workshop on the PEFA methodology was carried out during the field mission for key personnel of

the five line ministries as well as officials from the Ministries of Planning and Sustainable Development and Finance and the Economy. Some donor and civil society representatives were also present.

As one of the key deliverables, an inception report was presented to the EU Delegation, which included a work plan with a schedule of meetings and key MDA staff needed. The team of consultants received an excellent cooperation from Government officials, donor partners and civil society organisations in spite of time constraints and busy work schedules. Responses to the consultants request with regards to official documentation as supporting evidence in addition to additional meeting schedules were timely met. Many of the interviews required the presence of key heads of divisions under each line ministry, namely planning, budgeting, procurement, internal audit, accounting and payroll. The meetings were fully graced by the presence of Permanent Secretaries of the various line ministries visited. The triangulation process was fully appreciated by each interviewee, having understood that it serves as check on the right type of information for quality assurance. The inter-linkages of PFM systems and procedures in each division underscored the need to have all the key heads of divisions to avail themselves for the interviews during the field mission.

At the end of the field mission, a debriefing workshop was organised, and preliminary findings were presented to government officials and donors. The draft report was submitted to all stakeholders for review and comments after which the final report was submitted, aimed at improving the dialogue on PFM improvements and reform between government and donors.

Assessment team

The EU Delegation contracted ACE International Consultants, Spain for the assignment. Two PFM experts were hired by ACE for the mission. They were Ronald E. Quist (Team Lead) and Charles K. Hegbor (Expert 2)

1.3 Methodology

A review of the legal and regulatory framework that governs Public Finance Management was important for placing the exercise in the appropriate legal and regulatory framework context.

The PEFA methodology framework was adopted. This involves the use of PFM performance measurement framework to measure the strength of PFM reforms. An effective and orderly PFM measurement framework required these three levels of budgetary outcomes, namely:

1. Effective controls of the budget totals and management of fiscal risks contributing to maintain aggregate fiscal discipline.
2. Planning and executing the budget in line with government/MDA priorities contributing to implementation of government's objectives, otherwise known as strategic allocation of resources.
3. Managing the use of budgeted resources contributing to efficient service delivery and value for money

Undertaking a PFM reform also requires an assessment of capacity. This is important to ascertain the pace and extent to which PFM reform activities can be implemented. It also provides a basis for determining a realistic program of training workshops and capacity development support.

The 2013 Sector PEFA assessment was the first in its kind and involved the following:

- Review of legal and regulatory documentation, budget documentation and financial and audit reports;
- Assessment of the requirements for further analysis and evaluation of PFM practice in the central government and the three specific sectors, based upon interviews with Government Officials in the Ministry of Finance, Central Bank of Trinidad and Tobago, the Parliament, the Office of the Auditor-General, the Ministries of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development, Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment, Ministry of Food Production, Ministry of Environment and Water Resources and the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs
- Interviews with development partners - the European Union and the Inter-American Development Bank
- Quantitative analysis of official financial and budgetary data;
- Assessments of PFM procedures and systems; and
- The application of professional judgment

An important consideration in developing these indicators is an appreciation of the quality, comprehensiveness and accuracy of data that is used to determine the indicators. The reliability of the indicators can only be as good as the accuracy of the financial data upon which they were calculated. Emphasis was placed on the completeness and quality of financial data in determining the PEFA indicator measures.

In all, 20 Performance Indicators (PIs) were relevant to the sector PEFA assessment. As shown in the table below, some PIs were assessed only to the extent that their sub-dimensions were relevant; these were PI-12(iii), PI-12(iv), PI-16(i), PI-17(ii), PI-25(i), PI-25(ii) and PI-26(iii).

No.	Performance Indicators	2013 Assessment
PI-1	Aggregate expenditure out-turn compared to original approved budget	√
PI-3	Aggregate revenue out-turn compared to original approved budget	√
PI-4	Stock and Monitoring of Expenditure Payment Arrears	√
PI-5	Classification of the budget	√
PI-7	Extent of Unreported Government Operations	√
PI-11	Orderliness and participation in the annual budget process	√
PI-12	Multi-year perspective in fiscal planning, expenditure policy and budgeting	√
PI-12(iii)	Existence of Costed Sector Strategies	√
PI-12(iv)	Linkages between investment budgets and forward expenditure estimates	√
PI-16	Predictability in the Availability of Funds for Commitment of Expenditure	√
PI-16(i)	Extent to which cash flows are forecast and monitored	√
PI-17	Recording and Management of Cash Balances, Debt and Guarantees	√
PI-17(ii)	Extent of consolidation of the government's cash balances	√
PI-18	Effectiveness of payroll controls	√
PI-19	Competition, value for money and controls in procurement	√
PI-20	Effectiveness of internal controls for non-salary expenditure	√
PI-21	Effectiveness of internal audit	√
PI-22	Timeliness and Regularity of Accounts Reconciliation	√
PI-23	Availability of information on resources received by service delivery units	√
PI-24	Quality and Timeliness of in-year budget reports	√
PI-25	Quality and timeliness of annual financial statements	√
PI-25(i)	Completeness of the financial statements	√
PI-25(ii)	Timeliness of submission of the financial statements	√
PI-26	Scope, nature and follow-up of external audit	√
PI-26(iii)	Evidence of follow up on audit recommendations	√
D-2	Financial info provided by donors on project and program aid	√

D-3	Proportion of aid that is managed by use of national procedures	√
-----	---	---

1.4 Scope of the assessment

As suggested in the PEFA guidelines, the following main PFM indicators were adopted as a guiding framework for assessing the current status of PFM practice and performance in Trinidad & Tobago. Six main dimensions were considered as detailed below; however not all the 31 Performance Indicators were assessed since some were irrelevant to the sector PEFA assessment.

For each sector assessed the scope of the expenditure assessed corresponded to that managed directly by the corresponding line ministries. It did not include expenditure managed through subvented agencies or other public enterprises under the responsibility of the particular line ministry.

The assessment also looked into revenue sources and its expenditure, application of procurement and contracting procedures at the national and MDA level.

As required by the Terms of Reference, three sectors under the support of the EU budget support operations, namely environmental governance, private sector development support and diversification from sugar production were screened using the PEFA methodology dimensions in order to assess relevant PFM issues in those sectors. Five Ministries under the three sectors were reviewed, namely Ministry of Food Production, Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment, Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs, Ministry of Environment and Water Resources and Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development, .

2 Country Background Information

A detailed description of country background information is given in volume 1 (central government assessment) of the report.

3 Assessment of PFM Systems, processes and institutions

3.1 Budget credibility

3.1.1 *PI-1 Aggregate expenditure out-turn compared to original approved budget*

Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) prepare their annual budget from the annual operational plans derived from the 3 to 5 year strategic plans in line with the National Medium Term Policy Framework. These budgets are prepared without any fiscal ceiling from the Ministry of Finance. Budget call circulars are issued between February and March each year with approximately two month window for MDAs to complete their estimates. Each ministry between July and September attends a budget hearing with the Ministry of Finance to justify their estimates. The Ministry of Finance then slashes those estimates based on the national resource envelop. By this approach, MDAs will then re-prioritise their projects and programs based on their approved allocations. It should be noted that for all projects and programs above TT\$1million, MDAs must seek cabinet approval in order to be included in the PSIP for fund allocation; even at this stage, the Finance Ministry still has the ultimate responsibility to allocate funds for all or part of the approved cabinet program estimates.

The absence of firm fiscal ceilings prior to the preparation of budget estimates encourages the preparation and submission of 'wish lists' by MDAs and cutbacks by the Ministry of Finance, which is a disincentive to all stakeholders. This practice has necessitated, in all the last three completed years of this assessment - 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012, the introduction of supplementary budget which allows MDAs to source for additional funding for their projects. The analyses in Tables 3.1 to 3.5 below corroborate these assertions. All the MDAs under the EU sector budget support with the exception of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs had aggregate expenditure deviations between primary original budget and primary outturn of more than 15% in two of the three years assessed. Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs on the other hand has an aggregate deviation of at least about 6% in two of the three years. The results of the analysis referencing the Ministry of Energy was corroborated by interactions from officials of the ministry pointing to the fact that at least between 90% to 95% of their budget estimates usually get approved by the Finance Ministry and the Parliament.

Table 3.1 Comparison of Budget estimates against Actuals (primary expenditure, TT\$): Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment

	2009/2010	2010/2011	2011/2012
Primary original expenditure	308,952,410	291,413,850	404,781,500
Primary outturn	437,736,377	276,444,813	548,931,865
Aggregate expenditure deviation	(128,783,967)	14,969,037	(144,150,365)
Aggregate expenditure deviation,%	-41.7%	5.1%	-35.6%

Source: MOFE

Table 3.2 Comparison of Budget estimates against Actuals (primary expenditure, TT\$): Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development

	2009/2010	2010/2011	2011/2012
Primary original expenditure	191,170,300	207,283,630	202,438,032
Primary outturn	177,012,996	172,986,273	170,577,295

	2009/2010	2010/2011	2011/2012
Aggregate expenditure deviation	14,157,304	34,297,357	31,860,737
Aggregate expenditure deviation, %	7.4%	16.5%	15.7%

Source: MOFE

Table 3.3 Comparison of Budget estimates against Actuals (primary expenditure, TT\$): Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs

	2009/2010	2010/2011	2011/2012
Primary original expenditure	1,546,958,420	1,597,015,370	2,054,778,573
Primary outturn	1,438,999,780	1,502,670,802	2,063,449,732
Aggregate expenditure deviation	107,958,640	94,344,568	(8,671,159)
Aggregate expenditure deviation, %	7.0%	5.9%	-0.4%

Source: MOFE

Table 3.4 Comparison of Budget estimates against Actuals (primary expenditure, TT\$): Ministry of Food Production

	2009/2010	2010/2011	2011/2012
Primary original expenditure	740,439,598	1,045,554,291	1,285,881,075
Primary outturn	613,765,847	1,032,139,282	1,080,319,152
Aggregate expenditure deviation	126,673,751	13,415,009	205,561,923
Aggregate expenditure deviation, %	17.1%	1.3%	16.0%

Source: MOFE

Table 3.5 Comparison of Budget estimates against Actuals (primary expenditure, TT\$): Ministry of Environment

	2009/2010	2010/2011	2011/2012
Primary original expenditure	1,260,777,400	1,602,791,350	1,739,999,130
Primary outturn	1,060,055,638	1,851,710,323	2,697,974,283
Aggregate expenditure deviation	200,721,762	(248,918,973)	(957,975,153)
Aggregate expenditure deviation, %	15.9%	-15.5%	-55.1%

Source: MOFE

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-1	Aggregate expenditure out-turn compared to original approved budget	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	D	In all the last three completed fiscal years, aggregate expenditure deviations were more than 15% between primary original budget and primary outturn. Actual deviations were -41.7%, 5.1% and -35.6% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
		Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	D	In two of the last three completed fiscal years, aggregate expenditure deviations were more than 15% between primary original budget and primary outturn. Actual deviations were 7.4%,

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
				16.5% and 15.7% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
		Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	B	In all of the last three completed fiscal years, aggregate expenditure deviation was below 10% between primary original budget and primary outturn. Actual deviations were 7.0%, 5.9% and -0.4% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
		Ministry of Food Production	D	In all the last three completed fiscal years, aggregate expenditure deviations were more than 15% between primary original budget and primary outturn. Actual deviations were 17.1%, 1.3% and 16.0% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
		Ministry of Environment	D	In all the last three completed fiscal years, aggregate expenditure deviations were more than 15% between primary original budget and primary outturn. Actual deviations were 15.9%, -15.5% and -55.1% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively

3.1.2 PI-3 Aggregate revenue out-turn compared to original approved budget

Information on approved revenue estimates and actual outturns were generated from the approved budget estimates and audited financial statements for the last completed fiscal years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012. It turns out that internally generated revenue by the Ministries of Trade and Labour are insignificant. Revenue is generated from trade licences and fees, and registration of private labour institutions referencing the Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment and the Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development respectively.

The Ministries of Food Production, and Environment and Water Resources generate some appreciable levels of revenue from veterinary and aqua culture services, environmental fees and water treatment services respectively. The Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs is the largest revenue-generating ministry among the five MDAs under the sector assessment. The Energy Ministry has two main sources of internally generated fund; the first is from the share of petroleum profit and the second is from royalties.

Revenue estimates of the share of petroleum profit are determined by using two separate revenue models for purposes of comparison and statistical efficiency. In addition, the oil and gas extracting companies submit their annual revenue projections; this is complemented by a tax and revenue audit report carried out by the audit section of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs. The final revenue estimates for the share of petroleum profit are determined out of the volume of oil and gas output and the price (this price is not the world market price of petroleum) with the collaboration of the Ministry of Finance and the Economy. It should be noted that the two prices for the estimates are used - one from the Ministry of Energy and the other from the Ministry of Finance and the Economy (MoFE). The final estimates adopt the MoFE price for inclusion into the national budget.

The second revenue stream for the Energy Ministry is petroleum royalties, which constitutes 12.5% of total output at the world market price or the selling price. Revenue estimates follow the same principle adopted by the first revenue source - share of petroleum profit. It should be stated that gas royalties do not have a fixed rate, as is the case with petroleum royalties.

As shown in Table 3.6 below, revenue forecasting compared to actual outturn is weak and lacks credibility. The Ministry of Environment and Water Resources did not budget for revenue but collected revenue for the FY 2010/2011 and 2011/2012.

Table 3.6: Aggregate Revenue Outturn

Aggregate Revenue Outturn	Ministry of Trade	Ministry of Labour	Ministry of Energy	Ministry of Food Prod.	Ministry of Environment
2009/2010					
Original budget	100,000.00	1,350.00	2,419,690,000.00	23,317,830.00	13,620,000.00
Actual revenue	137,155.00	173.00	2,900,350,860.00	13,039,581.00	17,214,998.00
% outturn	-37.16%	87.19%	-19.86%	44.08%	-26.39%
2010/2011					
Original budget	165,000.00	300.00	2,685,375,600.00	13,385,430.00	-
Actual revenue	170,365.00	120.00	2,724,187,761.00	2,478,720.00	131,139,764.00
% outturn	-3.25%	60.00%	-1.45%	81.48%	100.00%
2011/2012					
Original budget	167,100.00	300.00	2,830,002,330.00	8,397,550.00	-
Actual revenue	181,168.00	186.00	2,586,175,078.00	4,534,419.00	135,274,599.00
% outturn	-8.42%	38.00%	8.62%	46.00%	100.00%

Source: Approved budget estimates and audited financial statements for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-3	Actual domestic revenue compared to originally approved budget	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	C	Actual revenue outturn was 3.25% and 8.42% above estimates for 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively. In 2009/2010, the outturns were 37.16% above forecast.
		Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	D	Actual revenue outturns were 87.19%, 60% and 38% below estimates for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively.
		Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	D	Actual revenue outturns were 19.86% and 1.45% above estimates for 2009/2010 and 2010/2011 respectively. In 2011/2012 outturns were 8.62% below forecast

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
		Ministry of Food Production	D	Actual revenue outturns were 44.08%, 81.48% and 46% below estimates for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively.
		Ministry of Environment	D	Actual revenue outturns were 26.39%, 100% and 100% above estimates for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively.

3.1.3 PI-4 Stock and monitoring of expenditure payment arrears

(i) Stock of expenditure payment arrears

Expenditure arrears arise after a verified supplier invoice is overdue for payment after 30 calendar days. The commitment control mechanism is such that spending units are strictly required not to commit for any expenditure without the general release and cash release warrants from the Ministry of Finance. Occasionally, some spending units enter into some informal procurement practices as a measure to continue service delivery but this is of a minor scale. MDAs submit monthly outstanding commitment schedules to the Comptroller of Accounts and an annual outstanding commitment schedule reported in the notes to the annual financial statements submitted to the Auditor General. There is however no report on expenditure arrears. The outstanding commitments are not aged in order to establish the duration of the payment delays. As shown in Table 3.7 below, none of the five MDAs screened under the sector PEFA assessment have stock of outstanding commitments above 1.5% of total expenditure. The low levels of outstanding commitments guarantees low levels of expenditure arrears since outstanding commitments usually exceed expenditure arrears.

Table 3.7: Stock of Debt

Calculation of Stock of Debt - PI-4(i)					
	Ministry of Trade and Industry	Ministry of Labour Small & Micro Ent Dev	Ministry of Energy & Energy Affairs	Ministry of Food Production	Ministry of Environment
2009/2010					
Total Expenditure	437,736,377.00	177,012,996.00	1,438,999,780.00	613,765,847.00	1,060,055,638.00
Total Debt	2,000,726.95	549,616.68	539,553.01	8,998,188.83	2,068,254.01
% debt to total expenditure	0.46%	0.31%	0.04%	1.47%	0.20%
2010/2011					
Total Expenditure	276,444,813.00	172,986,273.00	1,502,670,802.00	1,032,139,282.00	1,851,710,323.00
Total Debt	1,151,474.97	352,416.61	539,553.01	2,321,041.96	165,853.80
% debt to total expenditure	0.42%	0.20%	0.04%	0.22%	0.01%
2011/2012					
Total Expenditure	548,931,865.00	170,577,295.00	2,063,449,732.00	1,080,319,152.00	2,697,974,283.00
Total Debt	368,127.00	510,762.99	8,280.00	203,736.82	0
% debt to total expenditure	0.07%	0.30%	0.00%	0.02%	0.00%

(ii) Availability of data for monitoring the stock of expenditure payment arrears

Each MDA is required to prepare and submit a monthly outstanding commitment schedule to the Comptroller of Accounts, as part of their monthly expenditure returns submissions. This has been the practice over the years. At the end of each financial year, each MDA prepares and reports in the notes of the annual financial statements, an outstanding commitment schedule. The commitment schedule however fails to provide an ageing report to ascertain the level of payment

delays. Even though expenditure arrears are not reported, the mechanism for tracking outstanding commitments provides reasonable assurance of the low level of expenditure arrears since outstanding commitments do always exceed expenditure arrears.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-4	Stock and monitoring of expenditure payment arrears			Scoring Method M1
(i)	Stock of expenditure payment arrears (as a percentage of actual total expenditure for the corresponding fiscal year) and a recent change in the stock	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	A	Stock of commitment arrears are below 2% of total expenditure, which suggests a low level of expenditure arrears. The actual levels are 0.46%, 0.42% and 0.07% of total expenditure for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
(ii)	Availability of data for monitoring the stock payment arrears		B	A monthly and an annual commitment schedule is generated and submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts and the Auditor General; however, the schedule does not include an ageing report. There is no report on expenditure arrears
	Overall score		B+	
(i)	Stock of expenditure payment arrears (as a percentage of actual total expenditure for the corresponding fiscal year) and a recent change in the stock	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	A	Stock of commitment arrears are below 2% of total expenditure, which suggests a low level of expenditure arrears. The actual levels are 0.31%, 0.2% and 0.3% of total expenditure for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
(ii)	Availability of data for monitoring the stock payment arrears		B	A monthly and an annual commitment schedule is generated and submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts and the Auditor General; however, the schedule does not include an ageing report. There is no report on expenditure arrears
	Overall score		B+	
(i)	Stock of expenditure payment arrears (as a percentage of actual total expenditure for the corresponding fiscal year) and a	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	A	Stock of commitment arrears are below 2% of total expenditure, which suggests a low level of expenditure arrears.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
	recent change in the stock			The actual levels are 0.04%, 0.04% and 0.00% of total expenditure for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
(ii)	Availability of data for monitoring the stock payment arrears		B	A monthly and an annual commitment schedule is generated and submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts and the Auditor General; however, the schedule does not include an ageing report. There is no report on expenditure arrears
	Overall score		B+	
(i)	Stock of expenditure payment arrears (as a percentage of actual total expenditure for the corresponding fiscal year) and a recent change in the stock	Ministry of Food Production	A	Stock of commitment arrears are below 2% of total expenditure, which suggests a low level of expenditure arrears. The actual levels are 1.47%, 0.22% and 0.02% of total expenditure for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
(ii)	Availability of data for monitoring the stock payment arrears		B	A monthly and an annual commitment schedule is generated and submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts and the Auditor General; however, the schedule does not include an ageing report. There is no report on expenditure arrears
	Overall score		B+	
(i)	Stock of expenditure payment arrears (as a percentage of actual total expenditure for the corresponding fiscal year) and a recent change in the stock	Ministry of Environment	A	Stock of commitment arrears are below 2% of total expenditure, which suggests a low level of expenditure arrears. The actual levels are 0.20%, 0.01% and 0.00% of total expenditure for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
(ii)	Availability of data for monitoring the stock payment arrears		B	A monthly and an annual commitment schedule is generated and submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts and the Auditor General; however, the

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
				schedule does not include an ageing report. There is no report on expenditure arrears
	Overall score		B+	

3.2 Comprehensiveness and transparency

3.2.1 PI-5 Classification of the budget

Ministries, Departments and Agencies budget conforms to Trinidad and Tobago's national budget, which is based on administrative and economic classification (Please refer to Table 3.8 below). Revenue estimates are insignificant in most of the MDAs but quite important particularly with the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs, Ministry of Food Production and the Ministry of Environment and Water Resources. The revenue estimates are classified under non-tax and grants. The expenditure budget is in two volumes, one for recurrent funded from the consolidated fund and the second for development program which has two sources of funding - consolidated fund and infrastructure development fund. Budget circulars over the last three completed fiscal years have continued to instruct ministries, departments and agencies to prepare their budget in the normal line item format with the inclusion of corporate and business plans as a preparatory phase towards moving to output-based budgeting. It should be noted that even though the current budget classification is not fully GFS/COFOG 2001 compliant, the use of mapping tables allows for such classification into functional and sub-functional classification. Monthly expenditure returns and annual financial statements are compatible with approved budget estimates and allows for easy financial analysis.

Table 3.8: Synthesis of the classification of the 2011/2012 Budget

Categories	FY 2011/2012			Remarks
	Budget preparation	Budget execution	MDAs budget reporting	
Administrative	Yes	yes	yes	Sub-administrative; number depends on administrative divisions in each MDA
Economic	Yes	yes	yes	Revenue: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Non-tax (property income, etc.) where applicable Other; Grants. Expenditure: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Item 1 – Personnel emoluments; Item 2 – Goods & Services Item 3 – Minor equipment purchases Item 4 – Current transfers and subsidies Item 5 - Acquisition of physical assets Item 6 - Current transfers to statutory boards
Functional (COFOG)	No	No	no	The use of mapping tables allows for sub-functional classification and reporting to IMF

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-5	Classification of the budget	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	C	The budget is classified under sub-administrative and economic headings. Financial reporting is consistent with the budget classification
		Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	C	The budget is classified under sub-administrative and economic headings. Financial reporting is consistent with the budget classification
		Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	C	The budget is classified under sub-administrative and economic headings. Financial reporting is consistent with the budget classification
		Ministry of Food Production	C	The budget is classified under sub-administrative and economic headings. Financial reporting is consistent with the budget classification
		Ministry of Environment	C	The budget is classified under sub-administrative and economic headings. Financial reporting is consistent with the budget classification

Ongoing reforms

No reforms

3.2.2 PI-7 Extent of unreported government operations

(i) The level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure

Unreported extra-budgetary expenditures are those expenditures incurred outside the normal budget system. This may include unbudgeted revenue and expenditure and other forms of assistance in kind not reported. The five MDAs under the sector assessment include all revenue and expenditure estimates in their annual budget, indicating the source of revenue where it is a donor grant, except for donor support in kind and technical assistance, which are insignificant. Except for the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs that operates a deposit bank account held by the Central Bank under the legal authority of the Comptroller of Accounts, none of the remaining four MDAs has a separate bank account. All revenues and expenditures through the separate deposit bank account held by the Ministry of Energy are fully reported. Interactions with officials of these MDAs suggest none of the divisions or agencies under their jurisdiction enter into unbudgeted activities for revenue generation or expenditure incurrence. There are however a number of Special Purpose Companies (wholly owned state enterprises) under most of the MDAs. These include National Enterprises Development Company Limited (NEDCO) - Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development, National Energy (NE) - Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs, National Agricultural Marketing Development Company (NAMDEVCO) - Ministry of

Food Production, among others, that receive government subsidies; these subsidies are budgeted and reported in the annual financial statements as transfers and subsidies.

At present time, there are no Public Private Partnerships (PPPs) arrangements within any of the five MDAs assessed. Officials however intimated that some discussions are ongoing, but rather at the early state regarding PPP arrangements.

ii) Income/expenditure information on donor-funded projects

The major donors in Trinidad and Tobago - EU and IADB, within the last three completed fiscal years have used national PFM systems in providing aid support to the country. While the EU provided sector budget support, the IADB provided both sector support and policy bases loans, all of which are transferred directly to the Treasury accounts. All these funds use national procurement, accounting, reporting and auditing systems. Available information obtained from both donors reflects a more than 90% of total aid (direct budget support and sector budget support) using national systems (D-3 below, Table 3.17). There are however donor projects and programs supporting the Ministry of Energy, Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment and Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development and some other government agencies such as the Office of the Auditor General; this support is in the form of technical assistance and paid directly by the donors. The total value of the supports is insignificant and below 1% of total MDA expenditure.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-7	Extent of unreported government operations			Scoring Method M1.
(i)	Level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	A	MDAs budget for all revenue estimates and report on all expenditure incurred. There are no PPPs at present. The level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure, if any, is insignificant.
(ii)	Income/expenditure information on donor-funded projects		A	More than 90% of donor support is done through the National Treasury, thereby using national PFM systems. Other donor program and project support, such as Technical Assistance is insignificant (below 1% of total MDA expenditure)
	Overall score		A	
(i)	Level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	A	MDAs budget for all revenue estimates and report on all expenditure incurred. There are no PPPs at present. The level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure, if any, is insignificant.
(ii))	Income/expenditure information on donor-funded projects		A	More than 90% of donor support is done through the National

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
				Treasury, thereby using national PFM systems. Other donor program and project support, such as Technical Assistance is insignificant (below 1% of total MDA expenditure)
	Overall score		A	
(i)	Level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	A	MDAs budget for all revenue estimates and report on all expenditure incurred. There are no PPPs at present. The level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure, if any, is insignificant.
(ii)	Income/expenditure information on donor-funded projects		A	More than 90% of donor support is done through the National Treasury, thereby using national PFM systems. Other donor program and project support, such as Technical Assistance is insignificant (below 1% of total MDA expenditure)
	Overall score		A	
(i)	Level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure	Ministry of Food Production	A	MDAs budget for all revenue estimates and report on all expenditure incurred. There are no PPPs at present. The level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure, if any, is insignificant.
(ii)	Income/expenditure information on donor-funded projects		A	More than 90% of donor support is done through the National Treasury, thereby using national PFM systems. Other donor program and project support, such as Technical Assistance is insignificant (below 1% of total MDA expenditure)
	Overall score		A	
(i)	Level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure	Ministry of Environment	A	MDAs budget for all revenue estimates and report on all expenditure incurred. There are no PPPs at present. The level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure, if any, is

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
				insignificant.
(ii)	Income/expenditure information on donor-funded projects		A	More than 90% of donor support is done through the National Treasury, thereby using national PFM systems. Other donor program and project support, such as Technical Assistance is insignificant (below 1% of total MDA expenditure)
	Overall score		A	

3.3 Policy-based budgeting

3.3.1 PI-11 Orderliness and participation in the annual budget process

(i) Existence of and adherence to a fixed budget calendar

Ministries, Departments and Agencies receive budget circulars from the Ministry of Finance and the Economy between February and March each year. MDAs send copies of the same budget circular to their divisions for the preparation of divisional budgets then consolidated into the MDA budget. The internal MDA processes take a maximum of two weeks to complete the draft divisional estimates. Officials from the various divisions of the ministries say the circular is clear and unambiguous.

Just as the circulars from the Ministry of Finance do not have budget ceilings, the same applies for the divisional budget circulars, since the same copy is distributed to the various divisions under the MDA. The absence of budget ceilings encourages the preparation of a 'wish list' budget estimate far more and above their realistic operational levels; cutbacks from the Ministry of Finance do have significant effect on divisional estimates since planned activities need re-prioritisation. Table 3.9 below shows the budget preparation calendar for ministries, departments and agencies and their divisions

Table 3.9: Budget Preparation and Approval Calendar

	FY2009/2010	FY2010/2011	FY2011/2012
Budget Circular issued by MOFE to MDAs	20th February 2009	5th March 2010	3rd March 2011
Budget Circular issued to MDA divisions	25th February 2009	8th March 2010	7th March 2011
Budget proposals from MDAs divisions due	15th March 2009	21st March 2010	21st March 2011
Budget proposals from MDAs due	30th April 2009	30th April 2010	30th April 2011
Budget estimates submitted to Parliament	7th Sept 2009	8th Sept 2010	10th Oct 2011

(ii) Clarity/comprehensiveness of and political involvement in the guidance on the preparation of budget submissions

The absence of direct political involvement at the beginning of the budget preparation process from cabinet and political heads, affects the internal political involvement of each line ministry. The bottom-up perspective which involves divisional budget preparation and submissions, is not guided by a top-down approach which involves the setting up of firm fiscal ceilings indicating the resource

envelop available to each division. Therefore, forecast programs and projects are a 'wish list' from each division, which tend to be trimmed down drastically and out of the initial strategic plan due to heavy budget cuts from the Finance Ministry. It has become common practice that each year, a supplementary budget is prepared to address the short falls in expenditure projections of MDAs and their divisions.

(iii) Timely budget approval by the legislature or similarly mandated body

Table 3.10 provides the exact dates the legislature received the budget estimates and the date of approval. In two of the last three completed fiscal years, 2009/2010 and 2010/2011, the legislature approved the budget prior to the start of the new fiscal year. In 2011/2012 however, the estimates were approved three weeks after the end of the fiscal year. It should be noted that the approval of the national budget signifies same for MDAs and their divisions. Article 114 of the Constitution allows the Minister of Finance to continuing spending from the Consolidated Fund for normal government operations thirty days after the expiration of the financial year in the event that the Legislature delays in passing the Appropriations Act before the end of the current fiscal year

Table 3.10: Timeliness of Parliamentary approval of Budget Appropriations

Fiscal Year	Date Parliament Received Budget	Date Parliament Approved Budget
2009/2010	7th Sept 2009	25th Sept 2009
2010/2011	8th Sept 2010	23rd Sept 2010
2011/2012	10th Oct 2011	21st Oct 2011

Source: Clerk to the Senate

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sector	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-11	Orderliness and participation in the annual budget process			
(i)	Existence of and adherence to a fixed budget calendar	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	A	A clear budget circular exist. Copies of the same circular from MoFE are distributed to each division of MDA. Each division has about two weeks to prepare their budget estimates; however, a total of two months is given to each MDA to prepare and submit estimates to MoFE
(ii)	Guidance on the Preparation of budget submissions.		D	A budget circular is issued to each MDA and copies are distributed to each MDA division. However, the circulars have no budget ceilings to guide the budget estimates leading to preparation and submission of 'wish lists'
(iii)	Timely budget approval by the legislature		B	In two of the last three completed fiscal years 2009/2010 and 2011/2012, the legislature approved the budget estimates before the end of the fiscal year
	Overall score		B	

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sector	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
(i)	Existence of and adherence to a fixed budget calendar	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	A	A clear budget circular exist. Copies of the same circular from MoFE are distributed to each division of MDA. Each division has about two weeks to prepare their budget estimates; however, a total of two months is given to each MDA to prepare and submit estimates to MoFE
(ii)	Guidance on the Preparation of budget submissions.		D	A budget circular is issued to each MDA and copies are distributed to each MDA division. However, the circulars have no budget ceilings to guide the budget estimates leading to preparation and submission of 'wish lists'
(iii)	Timely budget approval by the legislature		B	In two of the last three completed fiscal years 2009/2010 and 2011/2012, the legislature approved the budget estimates before the end of the fiscal year
	Overall score		B	
(i)	Existence of and adherence to a fixed budget calendar	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	A	A clear budget circular exist. Copies of the same circular from MoFE are distributed to each division of MDA. Each division has about two weeks to prepare their budget estimates; however, a total of two months is given to each MDA to prepare and submit estimates to MoFE
(ii)	Guidance on the Preparation of budget submissions.		D	A budget circular is issued to each MDA and copies are distributed to each MDA division. However, the circulars have no budget ceilings to guide the budget estimates leading to preparation and submission of 'wish lists'
(iii)	Timely budget approval by the legislature		B	In two of the last three completed fiscal years 2009/2010 and 2011/2012, the legislature approved the budget estimates before the end of the fiscal year
	Overall score		B	
(i)	Existence of and adherence to a		A	A clear budget circular exist.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sector	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
	fixed budget calendar	Ministry of Food Production		Copies of the same circular from MoFE are distributed to each division of MDA. Each division has about two weeks to prepare their budget estimates; however, a total of two months is given to each MDA to prepare and submit estimates to MoFE
(ii)	Guidance on the Preparation of budget submissions.		D	A budget circular is issued to each MDA and copies are distributed to each MDA division. However, the circulars have no budget ceilings to guide the budget estimates leading to preparation and submission of 'wish lists'
(iii)	Timely budget approval by the legislature		B	In two of the last three completed fiscal years 2009/2010 and 2011/2012, the legislature approved the budget estimates before the end of the fiscal year
	Overall score		B	
(i)	Existence of and adherence to a fixed budget calendar	Ministry of Environment	A	A clear budget circular exist. Copies of the same circular from MoFE are distributed to each division of MDA. Each division has about two weeks to prepare their budget estimates; however, a total of two months is given to each MDA to prepare and submit estimates to MoFE
(ii)	Guidance on the Preparation of budget submissions.		D	A budget circular is issued to each MDA and copies are distributed to each MDA division. However, the circulars have no budget ceilings to guide the budget estimates leading to preparation and submission of 'wish lists'
(iii)	Timely budget approval by the legislature		B	In two of the last three completed fiscal years 2009/2010 and 2011/2012, the legislature approved the budget estimates before the end of the fiscal year
	Overall score		B	

Ongoing reforms

No reforms

3.3.2 PI-12 Multi-year perspective in fiscal planning, expenditure policy and budgeting

(i) Preparation of multi -year fiscal forecasts and functional allocation

This dimension is not applicable to the sector specific assessment

(ii) Scope and frequency of debt sustainability analysis

This dimension is not applicable to the sector specific assessment

(iii) Existence of sector strategies with multi-year costing of recurrent and investment expenditure

Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment

The Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment has a new 3-year draft strategic plan from 2013 to 2015. Usually, the strategic plan covers a 5-year period coinciding with the political term of office of a government. The strategy is derived from the National Medium Term Policy Framework. An annual operational plan is prepared out of the 3-year plan. During the preparation of the strategic plan, the Ministry has no indications whatsoever on the resource envelop and therefore engages in a 'wish list' exercise hoping to secure funding going forward. In spite of this, some historical cost perspective is taken in preparing the strategic plan. The plan is developed in collaboration with the Ministry of Planning and Sustainable Development. The strategy is more a reflection of the Ministry's plan than a holistic sector view of linked activities even though some consideration and thoughts are given when preparing the plan. Generally, the collaboration with other MDAs in the sector is weak; the only time that some collaboration takes place is at the implementation stage of the annual activity plan, which is developed into a budget document. The strategic plan is not costed to reflect investment expenditure or forward linked recurrent expenditure.

Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development

A 3-year strategic plan is prepared on a rolling basis and updated every three years but with quarterly reviews. The strategic plan is linked to the National Medium Term Policy Framework. There is no indication of resource envelop at the time of putting together the three-year strategy plan, and therefore the plan becomes a 'wish list' of planned activities, programs and projects. The strategy is not costed having an investment cost and a forward linked recurrent cost perspective. Several years ago, the strategic plan did provide a lump sum cost without any indicative cost breakdown of projects and programs. Projects and programs that ought to be part of the PSIP must receive cabinet approval in order to receive some funding from the Ministry of Finance. There are indications that with effect from the 2014/2015 fiscal year, some information regarding the fiscal space will be made available as part of the top-down fiscal discipline.

Ministry of Energy and Energy Resources

The Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs has a five-year current strategic plan spanning 2011 to 2015. Prior to the current plan, it had one, which expired in 2010. The 5-year policy document is directly linked to the National Medium Term Policy framework and also considers the global energy policy since Trinidad & Tobago's economy is largely energy (oil and gas) based. The plan is reviewed and updated every three years. Out of the strategic plan, an annual operational plan is developed that feeds into the budget estimates of the ministry. The plan is neither costed in relation to investment costs and forward linked recurrent expenditure, nor is it prepared taken cognisance of any fiscal resource envelop. Cabinet has approved a national energy policy, which identifies 12 strategic areas from which the current strategy is derived from.

Ministry of Food Production

The Ministry of Food Production, at present is drafting a new national food policy in line with the national policy framework aimed at ensuring food security. This draft policy is envisaged to be finalised by January 2014. There has been a gap in the policy framework due to the fact that the last national food policy covered the period 2005 to 2010, for which there has been no revision thereafter. Therefore, the current national food policy is intended to bridge that gap. Between 2010 and 2013, the Ministry of Food Production has been relying on the National Policy Framework in formulating its strategy plans. One of such plans is the National Food Production Action Plan, which is a three-year action plan from 2012 to 2015 having a more commodity and crop production focused perspective. Notably, there appears to be no direct linkage between the National Food Production Action Plan and the National Policy Framework. It is a possibility for a program or project under the food production action plan to receive funding even though such a program has no direct link from the National Policy Framework, provided the program receives Cabinet approval. At this time, there are no sector strategies prepared in Trinidad and Tobago even though there are plans towards that direction in the future. However, there are administrative or line ministries strategies derived from the Medium Term Policy Framework.

Ministry of Environment and Water Resources

This line ministry is a new ministry which was hitherto the Ministry of Housing and Environment. It was created by combining the Environment and Water and Sewerage Authority (WASA). It turns out that this new ministry has no strategic plan. Its budget is nonetheless linked to the National Medium Term Policy Framework. The budget is an annual activity document which has no multi-year perspective. Projects and programs that are captured by the PSIP receive cabinet approval but do not necessarily receive full funding from the Ministry of Finance as a result of cutbacks on expenditure estimates submitted to the Finance Ministry. There is a weak link between PSIP investment estimates and the recurrent budget. The delivery of programs under the PSIP is therefore hampered by the budget cutbacks during the finalisation of the budget estimates by the Ministry of Finance.

(iv) Linkages between investment budgets and forward expenditure estimates

Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment

The 3-year strategic plan is prepared without any fiscal ceilings. It is not costed to take into account investment expenditure and forward linked recurrent expenditure. Discussions and consultations are held with the Ministry of Planning and Sustainable Development regarding PSIP projects and programs. The Planning Ministry will only agree to include PSIP projects when there is evidence of cabinet approval and funding source. While officials of the Trade Ministry say no forward linked recurrent expenditure is considered during the preparation of 3-year strategic plan, officials of the Finance Ministry claim some elements of forward linked recurrent expenditure are considered at the budget preparation stage. The linkage between investment budget which is mainly driven by the PSIP under the Ministry of Planning is decoupled and weak. The budget cuts do not consider the adverse implications on either side of the expenditure - investment and recurrent.

Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development

The linkages between investment expenditures and forward linked recurrent expenditures are weak. The 3-year strategic plan is prepared without a firm fiscal ceiling; it is not costed to accommodate both investment cost and forward linked recurrent expenditure. The development of the strategic plan is done with the collaborative effort of the Ministry of Planning and Sustainable Development but has little or no interactive platform with other sector ministries to identify areas of common interest and funding. The annual budget is prepared out of the annual operational plan. The budget estimates do not reflect the full investment expenditure and forward linked recurrent expenditure.

Ministry of Energy and Energy Resources

The annual budget is derived from the 3-year strategic plan distilled out of an annual operational plan. Both the strategic plan and the annual budget are prepared without any fiscal ceilings. Budget cut-backs are used as a tool to discipline the budget estimates. The result of this is the decoupling of the strategic intentions from the actual annual operating plans. Even though the budget is costed, it fails to recognise the full costing of projects and programs referencing investment cost and forward linked recurrent expenditure.

Ministry of Food Production

Both the National Policy Framework and the Ministry of Food Production's National Food Production Action Plan are not costed to reflect the investment cost and forward linked recurrent expenditure estimates. The preparation of the National Food Production Action Plan is done without any ceilings and cost mapping to food production action plan. There are discussions held between the Ministry of Food Production and the Ministry of Planning and Sustainable Development regarding projects and programs under the PSIP during the preparation of annual budget estimates; these discussions are done without any knowledge of fiscal ceilings from the Ministry of Finance. When funding gaps arise, the recurrent budget approved by Parliament for a specific year is used to fund the activities of the food production plan. Further, the Ministry of Food Production justifies the release of funds under the Public Sector Investments Program (PSIP) before any funding is made available.

Ministry of Environment and Water Resources

Since there is no strategic plan for the Ministry, the annual budget serves as its policy document, which is derived from the Medium Term Policy Framework. The budget estimates are prepared following the receipt of budget circular from the Ministry of Finance. The circulars have no fiscal ceilings to serve as a top-down fiscal discipline, resulting in the preparation and submission of a 'wish list' of up to three times the final allocations. There is weak linkage between the PSIP investment costing and the recurrent budget estimates.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-12	Multi-year perspective in fiscal planning, expenditure policy and budgeting			
(i)	Multi-year fiscal forecast and functional allocations	Ministry of Trade, Industry and investment	Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(ii)	Scope and frequency of debt sustainability Analysis		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(iii)	Existence of costed sector strategies		D	Strategic plans are prepared over a three-year period, linked to the Medium Term Police Framework. However, they are not costed having investment and forward linked recurrent cost perspective
(iv)	Linkages between investment budgets		D	There are no linkages between investment cost and forward linked recurrent budget estimates; where they exist, the link is very weak
	Overall score		D	

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
(i)	Multi-year fiscal forecast and functional allocations	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(ii)	Scope and frequency of debt sustainability Analysis		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(iii)	Existence of costed sector strategies		D	Strategic plans are prepared over a three-year period, linked to the Medium Term Police Framework. However, they are not costed having investment and forward linked recurrent cost perspective
(iv)	Linkages between investment budgets		D	There are no linkages between investment cost and forward linked recurrent budget estimates; where they exist, the link is very weak
	Overall score		D	
(i)	Multi-year fiscal forecast and functional allocations	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(ii)	Scope and frequency of debt sustainability Analysis		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(iii)	Existence of costed sector strategies		D	Strategic plans are prepared over a three-year period, linked to the Medium Term Police Framework. However, they are not costed having investment and forward linked recurrent cost perspective
(iv)	Linkages between investment budgets		D	There are no linkages between investment cost and forward linked recurrent budget estimates; where they exist, the link is very weak
	Overall score		D	
(i)	Multi-year fiscal forecast and functional allocations	Ministry of Food Production	Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(ii)	Scope and frequency of debt sustainability Analysis		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(iii)	Existence of costed sector strategies		D	Strategic plans are prepared over a three-year period, linked to the Medium Term Police Framework. However, they are not costed having investment and forward linked recurrent cost perspective
(iv)	Linkages between investment budgets		D	There are no linkages between investment cost and forward linked recurrent budget estimates;

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
				where they exist, the link is very weak
	Overall score		D	
(i)	Multi-year fiscal forecast and functional allocations	Ministry of Environment and Water Resources	Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(ii)	Scope and frequency of debt sustainability Analysis		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(iii)	Existence of costed sector strategies		D	There is no strategic plan for this line ministry as it turns out to be a new ministry. The annual budget is however linked to the Medium Term Policy Framework
(iv)	Linkages between investment budgets		D	There are no linkages between investment cost and forward linked recurrent budget estimates; where they exist, the link is very weak
	Overall score		D	

Ongoing reforms:

No reforms

3.4 Predictability and control in budget execution

3.4.1 PI-16 Predictability in the availability of funds for commitment of expenditures

(i) Extent to which cash flows are forecast and monitored

After the approval of the national budget by the legislature, each MDA is required to prepare an annual activity implementation plan together with an annual cash flow and submit it to the Ministry of Finance Budget Division. The annual activity implementation plan (in principle, the procurement plan) has the full complement of the estimates - which has to be re-prioritised as a result of the cutbacks in the budget preparation and approval process by the Ministry of Finance since the call circulars do not incorporate firm budget ceilings. Cash release warrants are on a three-month horizon, based on the pro-forma cash flow submissions of each MDA. Within two weeks after the end of each month, an activity progress report is submitted to the Ministry of Finance in order to justify the further release of fund, going forward. The cash flow statements are updated at least once every month in line with the activity progress report. Officials of MDAs confirmed that spending units under their ministries attempt to front-load their cash requests as it turns out to be easier to manage their expenditure portfolios. As a requirement, the head office of the MDAs ensures that each spending unit attaches a justification schedule for the needed cash to meet their expenditure commitments; the Ministry of Finance also requires copies of those justifications prior to the release of funds.

(ii) Reliability and horizon of periodic in-year information to MDAs on ceilings for expenditure commitment

This dimension is not relevant to the sector assessment

(iii) Frequency and transparency of adjustments to budget allocations, which are decided above the level of management of MDAs

This dimension is not relevant to the sector assessment

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-16	Predictability in the availability of funds for commitment of expenditures			Scoring Method M1.
(i)	Extent to which cash flows are forecast and monitored	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	A	An annual cash flow statement is prepared together with an activity implementation plan (procurement plan) with the full complement of approved estimates. The cash flow statement is updated each month in line with the activity progress report
(ii)	Reliability and horizon of periodic in-year information to MDAs on ceilings for expenditure commitment.		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(iii)	Frequency and transparency of adjustment to budget allocations, which are decided above the management of Line Ministries		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(i)	Extent to which cash flows are forecast and monitored	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	A	An annual cash flow statement is prepared together with an activity implementation plan (procurement plan) with the full complement of approved estimates. The cash flow statement is updated each month in line with the activity progress report
(ii)	Reliability and horizon of periodic in-year information to MDAs on ceilings for expenditure commitment.		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(iii)	Frequency and transparency of adjustment to budget allocations, which are decided above the management of Line Ministries		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(i)	Extent to which cash flows are		A	An annual cash flow statement

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
	forecast and monitored	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs		is prepared together with an activity implementation plan (procurement plan) with the full complement of approved estimates. The cash flow statement is updated each month in line with the activity progress report
(ii)	Reliability and horizon of periodic in-year information to MDAs on ceilings for expenditure commitment.		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(iii)	Frequency and transparency of adjustment to budget allocations, which are decided above the management of Line Ministries		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(i)	Extent to which cash flows are forecast and monitored	Ministry of Food Production	A	An annual cash flow statement is prepared together with an activity implementation plan (procurement plan) with the full complement of approved estimates. The cash flow statement is updated each month in line with the activity progress report
(ii)	Reliability and horizon of periodic in-year information to MDAs on ceilings for expenditure commitment.		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(iii)	Frequency and transparency of adjustment to budget allocations, which are decided above the management of Line Ministries		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	
(i)	Extent to which cash flows are forecast and monitored	Ministry of Environment	A	An annual cash flow statement is prepared together with an activity implementation plan (procurement plan) with the full complement of approved estimates. The cash flow statement is updated each month in line with the activity progress report
(ii)	Reliability and horizon of periodic in-year information to		Not Applicable to the sector assessment	

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
	MDAs on ceilings for expenditure commitment.			
(iii)	Frequency and transparency of adjustment to budget allocations, which are decided above the management of Line Ministries			Not Applicable to the sector assessment

3.4.2 PI-17 Recording and management of cash balances, debt and guarantees

(i) Quality of debt data recording and reporting

This dimension is not relevant to the sector assessment

(ii) Extent of consolidation of the government's cash balances

The Comptroller of Accounts uses the Treasury Single Account for the receipt and payment of all government transactions. Section 6 of the Exchequer and Audit Act Chapter 69:01 clearly states that no public official or institution shall open and operate a bank account without seeking the approval in writing of the Treasury. All the five MDAs under the EU sector budget support do not have separate bank account, except for the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs, which has a separate deposit bank account for internally generated fund (IGF) - approved under Section 13(c) of the Exchequer and Audit Act Chapter 69:01.

The deposit bank account retains the net (100%) of the total internally generated revenue less payments for all taxes due on oil and gas produced by oil companies. It should be noted that the bulk of the internally generated revenue from the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs is used to fund its own activities such as research and development initiatives as well as payment of scholarships for academic studies into the oil and gas sector. The National Treasury obtains daily bank transaction statements that allows the Comptroller of Accounts to establish the daily cash position of the central government. Even though most MDAs do not operate individual bank accounts, there is a daily cheque return card submitted to the Treasury for reconciliation; this allows MDAs to know the cash balance each day. Over the last three completed fiscal years, the arrangement has been for all donor funds to be deposited into the Treasury Single Account and therefore goes through the same cash reconciliation and consolidation process. The two main development partners - the EU and the IADB have confirmed the maintenance of some bank accounts for Technical Assistance purposes; the amounts held are negligible compared to the balances held by the Treasury Single Account.

(iii) Systems for contracting loans and issuance of guarantees

This dimension is not relevant to the sector assessment

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-17	Recording and			Scoring Method M2.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
	management of cash balances, debt and guarantees			
(i)	Quality of debt data recording and reporting	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	Not Applicable to sector assessment	
(ii)	Extent of consolidation of the Government's cash balances		A	MDAs do not operate separate bank accounts, with the exception of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs for IGF, mandated by the EAA. Daily banks statements are issued by the Central Bank for the reconciliation of the Treasury Single Account by the Comptroller of Accounts. MDAs also prepare daily cheque return cards and submit to the Treasury for reconciliation; this allows each MDA as well as the National Treasury to ascertain the daily cash balance.
(iii)	Systems for contracting loans and issuance of guarantees		Not Applicable to sector assessment	
(i)	Quality of debt data recording and reporting	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	Not Applicable to sector assessment	
(ii)	Extent of consolidation of the Government's cash balances		A	MDAs do not operate separate bank accounts, with the exception of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs for IGF, mandated by the EAA. Daily banks statements are issued by the Central Bank for the reconciliation of the Treasury Single Account by the Comptroller of Accounts. MDAs also prepare daily cheque return cards and submit to the Treasury for reconciliation; this allows each MDA as well as the National Treasury to ascertain the daily cash balance.
(iii)	Systems for contracting loans and issuance of guarantees		Not Applicable to sector assessment	
(i)	Quality of debt data recording and reporting	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	Not Applicable to sector assessment	
(ii)	Extent of consolidation of the Government's cash balances		A	The Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs maintains and operates a deposit bank account for IGF, mandated by the EAA in addition to the Treasury Single Account. Daily banks statements are

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
				issued by the Central Bank for the reconciliation of the Treasury Single Account by the Comptroller of Accounts. MDAs also prepare daily cheque return cards and submit to the Treasury for reconciliation; this allows each MDA as well as the National Treasury to ascertain the daily cash balance.
(iii)	Systems for contracting loans and issuance of guarantees		Not Applicable to sector assessment	
(i)	Quality of debt data recording and reporting	Ministry of Food Production	Not Applicable to sector assessment	
(ii)	Extent of consolidation of the Government's cash balances		A	MDAs do not operate separate bank accounts, with the exception of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs for IGF, mandated by the EAA. Daily banks statements are issued by the Central Bank for the reconciliation of the Treasury Single Account by the Comptroller of Accounts. MDAs also prepare daily cheque return cards and submit to the Treasury for reconciliation; this allows each MDA as well as the National Treasury to ascertain the daily cash balance.
(iii)	Systems for contracting loans and issuance of guarantees		Not Applicable to sector assessment	
(i)	Quality of debt data recording and reporting	Ministry of Environment	Not Applicable to sector assessment	
(ii)	Extent of consolidation of the Government's cash balances		A	MDAs do not operate separate bank accounts, with the exception of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs for IGF, mandated by the EAA. Daily banks statements are issued by the Central Bank for the reconciliation of the Treasury Single Account by the Comptroller of Accounts. MDAs also prepare daily cheque return cards and submit to the Treasury for reconciliation; this allows each MDA as well as the National Treasury to ascertain the daily cash balance.
(iii)	Systems for contracting loans and issuance of		Not Applicable to sector assessment	

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
	guarantees			

3.4.3 PI-18 Effectiveness of payroll controls

(i) Degree of integration and reconciliation between personnel records and payroll data

The management of public servants payroll is centralised at the Treasury. This is done through the Integrated Human Resource Information System (IHRIS), which has a three-link database interface: the establishment or post database, the personnel database and the payroll database. Each ministry, department and agency has a direct connectivity unto the personnel database of the IHRIS. The payroll budget of each MDA is derived from the establishment database and once approved by the Public Services Commission and funded by the Ministry of Finance, cannot be altered. Recruitment of new staff, promotions and terminations are the responsibility of MDAs following the approval of the establishment budget. New staff recruitments cannot be made unless there is a vacant post. The personnel database is directly linked to the payroll database and assures effective controls against ghosts. Each agency of each MDA prepares a monthly staff return schedule, which checks the physical presence of staff at post; this monthly staff check return is consolidated and reported to the payroll division of the Treasury for payment of monthly salaries. Occasionally, a staff may not be captured by the monthly staff return schedule in a particular month, but will be identified in the subsequent month's personnel return thereby flashing out ghost names within a maximum of two to three months.

(ii) Timeliness of changes to personnel records and the payroll

Changes to personnel database could be the result of new recruitment, promotion, termination or retirement. MDAs have direct access to the personnel database interface of IHRIS and are responsible for these changes once they occur. The IHRIS platform does not allow changes to the personnel records without the necessary authorisation. It is much easier to effect personnel changes within the head office of Ministries as personnel are easily located and therefore changes occur within 30 days. For personnel outside the ministries' head office, delays occur and it takes between two to three months to effect a change. The most effective tool for personnel reconciliation is the submission of monthly staff returns by each division within or outside Port of Spain to the head office of the appropriate ministry. Once the necessary approvals have been obtained for personnel changes, the National Treasury, based on the approved payroll budget, does the payroll changes in terms of additional salary or allowances for promotions, among others.

(iii) Internal controls of changes to personnel records and the payroll

The Integrated Human Resource Information System (IHRIS) has an in-built audit trail that monitors access to the platform by authorised staff of the human resource department of each MDA. Access codes or passwords remain confidential to authorised staff only. The IHRIS platform is capable of generating entry reports specifying date and time of entry as well as authorised staff. The internal controls within IHRIS are such that access to authorised human resource personnel is allowed only within the first week following the payment of monthly salaries, to allow for the necessary changes thereon.

(iv) Existence of payroll audits to identify control weaknesses and/or ghost workers

It turns out that each MDA prepares a monthly staff return check list that is submitted to the National Treasury; this is the regular reconciliation exercise undertaken by each MDA as part of the payroll audit process. It should be noted that no specific payroll audits have been carried out within the last three completed fiscal years, but the existence of regular monthly staff returns assures reasonable controls for checks and balances within each MDA. These monthly staff returns prepared by each supervisor provide a systematic and regular personnel audit thereby reducing the incidence of ghosts. Further, monthly exceptional payroll reports are generated by the Treasury and circulated to each MDA. The Internal Audit Unit in each MDA uses the monthly exceptional reports to assist the regular personnel checks.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-18	Effectiveness of payroll controls			Scoring Method M1.
(i)	Degree of integration and reconciliation between personnel records and payroll data	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	A	Payroll is managed centrally through the IHRIS platform, which has a three-link interface - establishment, personnel and payroll databases. The personnel database is linked to the payroll database and assures of effective control. Monthly staff checks are done to reconcile post with personnel and payroll
(ii)	Timeliness of changes to personnel records and the payroll		B	Changes to personnel database takes place within two to three months following detection and approval of changes
(iii)	Internal controls of changes to personnel records and the payroll		A	IHRIS platform is capable of generating audit trails that identified entry date and time as well as authorised staff with the necessary passwords.
(iv)	Existence of payroll audits to identify control weaknesses and /or ghost workers		C	Even though payroll audits have not been carried out within the last three completed fiscal years, regular monthly staff returns serve as a good proxy for payroll audit. Each supervisor submits the monthly staff return to the MDA head office.
	Overall score		C+	
(i)	Degree of integration and reconciliation between personnel records and payroll data	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	A	Payroll is managed centrally through the IHRIS platform, which has a three-link interface - establishment, personnel and payroll databases. The personnel database is linked to the payroll database and assures of effective control. Monthly staff checks are done to reconcile post with personnel and payroll
(ii)	Timeliness of changes to		B	Changes to personnel database takes

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
	personnel records and the payroll			place within two to three months following detection and approval of changes
(iii)	Internal controls of changes to personnel records and the payroll		A	IHRIS platform is capable of generating audit trails that identified entry date and time as well as authorised staff with the necessary passwords.
(iv)	Existence of payroll audits to identify control weaknesses and /or ghost workers		C	Even though payroll audits have not been carried out within the last three completed fiscal years, regular monthly staff returns serve as a good proxy for payroll audit. Each supervisor submits the monthly staff return to the MDA head office.
	Overall score		C+	
(i)	Degree of integration and reconciliation between personnel records and payroll data	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	A	Payroll is managed centrally through the IHRIS platform, which has a three-link interface - establishment, personnel and payroll databases. The personnel database is linked to the payroll database and assures of effective control. Monthly staff checks are done to reconcile post with personnel and payroll
(ii)	Timeliness of changes to personnel records and the payroll		B	Changes to personnel database takes place within two to three months following detection and approval of changes
(iii)	Internal controls of changes to personnel records and the payroll		A	IHRIS platform is capable of generating audit trails that identified entry date and time as well as authorised staff with the necessary passwords.
(iv)	Existence of payroll audits to identify control weaknesses and /or ghost workers		C	Even though payroll audits have not been carried out within the last three completed fiscal years, regular monthly staff returns serve as a good proxy for payroll audit. Each supervisor submits the monthly staff return to the MDA head office.
	Overall score		C+	
(i)	Degree of integration and reconciliation between personnel records and payroll data	Ministry of Food Production	A	Payroll is managed centrally through the IHRIS platform, which has a three-link interface - establishment, personnel and payroll databases. The personnel database is linked to the payroll database and assures of effective

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
				control. Monthly staff checks are done to reconcile post with personnel and payroll
(ii)	Timeliness of changes to personnel records and the payroll		B	Changes to personnel database takes place within two to three months following detection and approval of changes
(iii)	Internal controls of changes to personnel records and the payroll		A	IHRIS platform is capable of generating audit trails that identified entry date and time as well as authorised staff with the necessary passwords.
(iv)	Existence of payroll audits to identify control weaknesses and /or ghost workers		C	Even though payroll audits have not been carried out within the last three completed fiscal years, regular monthly staff returns serve as a good proxy for payroll audit. Each supervisor submits the monthly staff return to the MDA head office.
	Overall score		C+	
(i)	Degree of integration and reconciliation between personnel records and payroll data	Ministry of Environment	A	Payroll is managed centrally through the IHRIS platform, which has a three-link interface - establishment, personnel and payroll databases. The personnel database is linked to the payroll database and assures of effective control. Monthly staff checks are done to reconcile post with personnel and payroll
(ii)	Timeliness of changes to personnel records and the payroll		B	Changes to personnel database takes place within two to three months following detection and approval of changes
(iii)	Internal controls of changes to personnel records and the payroll		A	IHRIS platform is capable of generating audit trails that identified entry date and time as well as authorised staff with the necessary passwords.
(iv)	Existence of payroll audits to identify control weaknesses and /or ghost workers		C	Even though payroll audits have not been carried out within the last three completed fiscal years, regular monthly staff returns serve as a good proxy for payroll audit. Each supervisor submits the monthly staff return to the MDA head office.
	Overall score		C+	

3.4.4 PI-19 Competition, value for money and controls in procurement

(i) Transparency, comprehensiveness and competition in the legal and regulatory framework

Table 3.11 below outlines the necessary elements of legal and regulatory framework for international best practices in procurement under public finance management. It turns out that each of the MDAs adopting the CTB Ordinance meets three out of the six elements.

The CTB Ordinance requires the Board to "invite members of the public in general" for procurement bids and thereby adopts open competition as the default method of procurement. There are two channels for Government procurement practices: one through the Centrals Tenders Board (CTB) governed by Centrals Tenders Board Ordinance No 22 1961, and the second using Special Purpose Companies - state owned companies. There are specific thresholds for each level of procurement committee. Permanent Secretaries may decide to adopt internal systems without the Centrals Tenders Board for projects and consultancy services of up to TT\$1million and TT\$0.5million respectively. Goods and Services above this threshold and up to TT\$2million must adopt the Ministerial Tender Committee - the ministerial tender committee is chaired by the director of contracts of the Centrals Tenders Board. Further, the Centrals Tenders Board oversees the procurement processes for all procurements above TT\$2million provided MDAs decide to use the Board. MDAs may choose to use special purpose companies if they so wish; the Special Purpose Companies are governed by separate legal and regulatory framework and procurement procedures. The introduction of Special Purpose Companies, officials say, was prompted by long legal and bureaucratic procurement rules and procedures under the CTB Ordinance.

Table 3.11: Elements of legal and regulatory framework of the CTB Ordinance

Number of requirements met	Elements of the legal and regulatory framework for procurement	Availability
Three out six elements met	Be organised hierarchically and precedence is clearly established.	√
	Be freely and easily accessible to the public through appropriate means.	√
	Apply to all procurement undertaken using government funds.	x
	Make <i>open</i> competitive procurement the default method of procurement and define clearly the situations in which other methods can be used and how this is to be justified.	√
	Provide for public access to all of the following procurement information: government procurement plans bidding opportunities, contract awards, and data on resolution of procurement complaints.	x
	Provide for an independent administrative procurement review process for handling procurement complaints by participants prior to contract signature.	x

(ii) Use of competitive procurement methods

The structure and composition of the Centrals Tenders Board is provided for under Section 5 of the Centrals Tenders Board Ordinance No. 22 of 1961 (Amended). It is made up 8 members, 5 from the public sector and the remaining 3 from the private sector, all appointed by the President. The membership is as follows:

- Director of Contracts of CTB – Chairman of the Board
- Deputy Director of Contracts of CTB – Deputy Chairman of the Board
- Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment - Member
- Comptroller of Accounts - Member
- Chief State Solicitor - Member
- 3 Private Sector Officials

As stipulated by Section 7(1) of the CTB Ordinance, the *ex officio* members, i.e. those appointed by the President, shall hold office as pleased by the President. Section 7(2) of the Ordinance further provides for a two-year office term for Board Members from the private sector but with a perpetual number of reappointment as stated by Section 7(3).

Article 20 of the CTB Ordinance requires the Board to invite the general public for procurement bids, which implies an adoption of open competition as the default method. The use of sole sourcing and restricted tender must be justified by each MDA and approved by the CTB. Further, the CTB Ordinance does not provide clear criteria for justification in the case of sole sourcing or restricted tender. In addition, there is no reliable and complete data of total value of contracts awarded under each of the procurement methods except for the open competitive tender.

Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) have raised concerns regarding the current legal framework for procurement, which tends to provide unfair competition within the public sector procurement, even with the use of CTB procedures. The situation, CSOs claim, is worsened with the involvement of State-owned Special Purpose Companies.

(iii) Public access to complete, reliable and timely procurement information

Complete access to reliable and timely procurement information means full access to MDAs procurement plans, bidding opportunities, contract awards, as well as information on resolution of procurement complaints. In Trinidad and Tobago, public access is limited to access to the CTB Ordinance No. 22 of 1961 on the Ministry of Finance website and Government Printer as well as copies of the Information Booklet published in April 2008. The booklet provides information on membership of the CTB, the financial limit of tenders to be submitted to CTB, the evaluation process, procurement method and cycle, among others. Standardised tender documents are used for any form or type of procurement; the tender documents fail to consider the type of item to be procured; for instance tender documents for IT infrastructure with all the technical specifications are the same for tender for the supply of stationery. Training of procurement personnel of the various MDAs is limited to a needs-basis when tenders are being prepared.

There is neither a legal requirement nor an administrative provision that mandates MDAs to publicise their annual procurement plans for the benefit of the general public and in particular, the suppliers and contractors who may wish to engage in government business. MDAs prepare activity implementation plans but fail to recognise the full complements of a procurement plan, which requires each procurement to state the method of procurement. The public gets further information on tenders only when they are advertised in the electronic and print media.

Contract awards are made public either on the CTB website or through the print media for open competitive procurements only. Special Purpose Companies, formed principally to undertake MDA procurements in a fast-track manner, have their internal procurement mechanisms different from those used by the CTB with little or no public access to full procurement information. Access to complaints resolution is very limited only to the aggrieved bidder; there is no independent complaints body.

(iv) Existence of an independent administrative procurement complaints system

The No. 22 of 1961 CTB Ordinance does not make provision for the establishment of an independent administrative complaints body or mechanism to adjudicate over any complaints received from any disgruntled bidder in the procurement process. Further, there is no window of opportunity in terms of days or weeks between the contract award date and the contract signing

date for aggrieved bidder(s) to file a complaint. As shown in Table 3.12 below there is no existence of independent complaints mechanism in any of the MDA.

The only opportunity for any discontented bidder(s) is to notify CTB in writing on their grievances, after which an investigation is conducted and reasons for disqualification of bidders in accordance with the Freedom of Information Act is made known to the said bidder. Even though decisions of these processes are not public, the CTB officially informs the Ministry of Public Administration of the outcome of investigations into the complaint filed.

Table 3.12: Complaints Review Process by each of the five MDAs

Complaints are reviewed by a body which:		
(i)	is comprised of experienced professionals, familiar with the legal framework for procurement, and includes members drawn from the private sector and civil society as well as government.	No
(ii)	is not involved in any capacity in procurement transactions or in the process leading to contract award decisions.	No
(iii)	does not charge fees that prohibit access by concerned parties.	No
(iv)	follows processes for submission and resolution of complaints that are clearly defined and publicly available.	No
(v)	exercises the authority to suspend the procurement process.	No
(vi)	issues decisions within the timeframe specified in the rules/regulations.	No
(vii)	issues decisions that are binding on all parties (without precluding subsequent access to an external higher authority).	No

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-19	Competition, value for money and controls in procurement			
(i)	Transparency, comprehensiveness and competition in the legal and regulatory framework	Ministry of Trade , Industry and Investment	C	The CTB Ordinance No 22 1961 meets only three out of the six elements of the legal and regulatory framework for international best practices, which is adopted by MDAs
(ii)	Use of competitive procurement methods		D	There is no data on total value of contracts awarded using sole sourcing or restricted tender.
(iii)	Public access to complete, reliable and timely procurement information		D	MDAs do not have a systematic mechanism for making available full procurement information to the public. Detailed procurement plans, bidding opportunities and complaint resolutions are not completely public notice
(iv)	Existence of an independent administrative procurement complaints system		D	There is no independent procurement complaints mechanism. Any complaint filed by a disgruntled bidder is investigated by the same board members of the CTB
	Overall score		D	

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
(i)	Transparency, comprehensiveness and competition in the legal and regulatory framework	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	C	The CTB Ordinance No 22 1961 meets only three out of the six elements of the legal and regulatory framework for international best practices, which is adopted by MDAs
(ii)	Use of competitive procurement methods		D	There is no data on total value of contracts awarded using sole sourcing or restricted tender.
(iii)	Public access to complete, reliable and timely procurement information		D	MDAs do not have a systematic mechanism for making available full procurement information to the public. Detailed procurement plans, bidding opportunities and complaint resolutions are not completely public notice
(iv)	Existence of an independent administrative procurement complaints system		D	There is no independent procurement complaints mechanism. Any complaint filed by a disgruntled bidder is investigated by the same board members of the CTB
	Overall score		D	
(i)	Transparency, comprehensiveness and competition in the legal and regulatory framework	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	C	The CTB Ordinance No 22 1961 meets only three out of the six elements of the legal and regulatory framework for international best practices, which is adopted by MDAs
(ii)	Use of competitive procurement methods		D	There is no data on total value of contracts awarded using sole sourcing or restricted tender.
(iii)	Public access to complete, reliable and timely procurement information		D	MDAs do not have a systematic mechanism for making available full procurement information to the public. Detailed procurement plans, bidding opportunities and complaint resolutions are not completely public notice
(iv)	Existence of an independent administrative procurement complaints system		D	There is no independent procurement complaints mechanism. Any complaint filed by a disgruntled bidder is investigated by the same board members of the CTB
	Overall score		D	
(i)	Transparency, comprehensiveness and competition in the legal and regulatory framework	Ministry of Food Production	C	The CTB Ordinance No 22 1961 meets only three out of the six elements of the legal and regulatory framework for international best practices, which is adopted by MDAs

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
(ii)	Use of competitive procurement methods		D	There is no data on total value of contracts awarded using sole sourcing or restricted tender.
(iii)	Public access to complete, reliable and timely procurement information		D	MDAs do not have a systematic mechanism for making available full procurement information to the public. Detailed procurement plans, bidding opportunities and complaint resolutions are not completely public notice
(iv)	Existence of an independent administrative procurement complaints system		D	There is no independent procurement complaints mechanism. Any complaint filed by a disgruntled bidder is investigated by the same board members of the CTB
	Overall score		D	
(i)	Transparency, comprehensiveness and competition in the legal and regulatory framework	Ministry of Environment	C	The CTB Ordinance No 22 1961 meets only three out of the six elements of the legal and regulatory framework for international best practices, which is adopted by MDAs
(ii)	Use of competitive procurement methods		D	There is no data on total value of contracts awarded using sole sourcing or restricted tender.
(iii)	Public access to complete, reliable and timely procurement information		D	MDAs do not have a systematic mechanism for making available full procurement information to the public. Detailed procurement plans, bidding opportunities and complaint resolutions are not completely public notice
(iv)	Existence of an independent administrative procurement complaints system		D	There is no independent procurement complaints mechanism. Any complaint filed by a disgruntled bidder is investigated by the same board members of the CTB
	Overall score		D	

3.4.5 PI-20 Effectiveness of internal controls for non-salary expenditure

(i) Effectiveness of expenditure commitment controls

Internal controls for non-salary expenditure are those regulatory frameworks that ensure the strict compliance and adherence to expenditure commitment levels in line with approved budget allocations, general release warrants and cash release warrants on a three-month horizon. Expenditure commitments can only be made at a time when cash releases are received by ministries, departments and agencies. The use of manual vote books at all levels of spending units is supposed to check compliance with respect to expenditure commitment. Interactions with officials from line ministries indicate the actual practice of compliance in most instances, with some limited

non-compliance cases. Spending units in the districts in particular for recurrent expenditure do commit expenditure, while awaiting for their cash releases. The control, as officials say, is more effective referencing development expenditure. In spite of breaches in some spending units across the districts, there is an efficient reporting mechanism where monthly reports on outstanding commitments are forwarded to the ministries head office for onward submission to the National Treasury.

(ii) Comprehensiveness, relevance and understanding of other internal control rules/ procedures

The National Treasury has an accounting manual, with copies available to all spending units both in hard copies and on the Treasury's website. A review of the accounting manual indicates simple, clear and succinct procedures for financial management of the public purse. Interactions with officials confirmed the consultants' position. The understanding of these internal control procedures is compromised by high staff turnover and constant staff reshuffles. Payment of expenditure emanates from the spending unit preparing a purchasing requisition approved by the head of the unit based on budget allocation and funds availability. Invitation for quotation (at least three quotations) is sought from potential suppliers after which the selection is made based on right specifications and price. A purchase order is issued to the selected bidder for the supply, which is accompanied with an invoice, a bill of quantity and a goods dispatch note. The internal audit unit vets all supporting documents prior to the issue of payment cheque by the finance department.

The Treasury, as part of measures to strengthen internal controls, is putting together an internal audit manual - which is at the draft stage, for all government agencies; this will become a standardised manual for an effective internal control framework

(iii) Degree of compliance with rules for processing and recording transactions

The challenge remains the level of compliance of internal control rules and procedures of all and sundry at all spending units. As indicated in PI-26(iii), there appear to be instances of non-compliance, ranging from payments made without supplies, overpayments to suppliers, breach of contract procedures, among others. Further, the degree of non-compliance re-echoes the significant amount of internal audit time spent on compliance and financial audit (PI-21(i)). Information from official sources indicates that non-compliance of internal control rules and procedures is sometimes deliberate, and others due to high staff turnover and reshuffling. Even though staff training is conducted, there appear to be insufficient training programs thereon.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-20	Effectiveness of internal controls for non-salary expenditure			Scoring Method M1.
(i)	Effectiveness of expenditure commitment controls	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	B	Expenditure is committed only when cash release warrants are received from the Ministry of Finance. The manual vote book in each spending unit is used to effectively control spending limits. This is much more effective for development expenditure, with minor breached referencing recurrent expenditure
(ii)	Comprehensiveness,		C	Internal controls are comprehensive

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
	relevance and understanding of other internal control rules/ procedures			as contained in the Treasury Accounting Manual; however, constant staff reshuffle as well as high staff turnover affects the understanding of these rules
(iii)	Degree of compliance with rules for processing and recording transactions		C	Clear and succinct internal controls rules and procedures exist and are generally adhered to with some breaches referencing procurement rules, payment for supplies, among others, becoming an issue of concern as reported by the Auditor General
	Overall score		C+	
(i)	Effectiveness of expenditure commitment controls	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	B	Expenditure is committed only when cash release warrants are received from the Ministry of Finance. The manual vote book in each spending unit is used to effectively control spending limits. This is much more effective for development expenditure, with minor breached referencing recurrent expenditure
(ii)	Comprehensiveness, relevance and understanding of other internal control rules/ procedures		C	Internal controls are comprehensive as contained in the Treasury Accounting Manual; however, constant staff reshuffle as well as high staff turnover affects the understanding of these rules
(iii)	Degree of compliance with rules for processing and recording transactions		C	Clear and succinct internal controls rules and procedures exist and are generally adhered to with some breaches referencing procurement rules, payment for supplies, among others, becoming an issue of concern as reported by the Auditor General
	Overall score		C+	
(i)	Effectiveness of expenditure commitment controls	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	B	Expenditure is committed only when cash release warrants are received from the Ministry of Finance. The manual vote book in each spending unit is used to effectively control spending limits. This is much more effective for development expenditure, with minor breached referencing recurrent expenditure
(ii)	Comprehensiveness,		C	Internal controls are comprehensive

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
	relevance and understanding of other internal control rules/ procedures			as contained in the Treasury Accounting Manual; however, constant staff reshuffle as well as high staff turnover affects the understanding of these rules
(iii)	Degree of compliance with rules for processing and recording transactions		C	Clear and succinct internal controls rules and procedures exist and are generally adhered to with some breaches referencing procurement rules, payment for supplies, among others, becoming an issue of concern as reported by the Auditor General
	Overall score		C+	
(i)	Effectiveness of expenditure commitment controls	Ministry of Food Production	B	Expenditure is committed only when cash release warrants are received from the Ministry of Finance. The manual vote book in each spending unit is used to effectively control spending limits. This is much more effective for development expenditure, with minor breached referencing recurrent expenditure
(ii)	Comprehensiveness, relevance and understanding of other internal control rules/ procedures		C	Internal controls are comprehensive as contained in the Treasury Accounting Manual; however, constant staff reshuffle as well as high staff turnover affects the understanding of these rules
(iii)	Degree of compliance with rules for processing and recording transactions		C	Clear and succinct internal controls rules and procedures exist and are generally adhered to with some breaches referencing procurement rules, payment for supplies, among others, becoming an issue of concern as reported by the Auditor General
	Overall score		C+	
(i)	Effectiveness of expenditure commitment controls	Ministry of Environment	B	Expenditure is committed only when cash release warrants are received from the Ministry of Finance. The manual vote book in each spending unit is used to effectively control spending limits. This is much more effective for development expenditure, with minor breached referencing recurrent expenditure
(ii)	Comprehensiveness,		C	Internal controls are comprehensive

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
	relevance and understanding of other internal control rules/ procedures			as contained in the Treasury Accounting Manual; however, constant staff reshuffle as well as high staff turnover affects the understanding of these rules
(iii)	Degree of compliance with rules for processing and recording transactions		C	Clear and succinct internal controls rules and procedures exist and are generally adhered to with some breaches referencing procurement rules, payment for supplies, among others, becoming an issue of concern as reported by the Auditor General
	Overall score		C+	

3.4.6 PI-21 Effectiveness of internal audit

(i) Coverage and quality of the internal audit function

The creation of internal audit units within government ministries, departments and agencies is governed by the EAA. Most of these ministries have internal audit units. The challenge remains the human resource capacity as well as qualified and certified internal auditors operating these units. Until recently (FY2013), there was no centralised internal audit manual (the current internal audit manual is a draft document yet to be finalised). The Treasury Accounting manual provides some useful internal audit guidelines for ministries, departments and agencies. Some ministries, with particular reference to the Ministry of Food Production, had their own internal audit manuals according to officials (no copy was sighted). Annual audit plans are prepared and approved by the Permanent Secretaries of each ministry. Officials confirmed that 80% to 85% of internal audit functions are on compliance and financial issues. Reasons for much focus on compliance audit are mainly due to constant staff reshuffles and turnover, as well as deliberate staff procedural breaches.

(ii) Frequency and distribution of reports

As it is a legal requirement under the Exchequer and Audit Act 1959 Chapter 69:01, Regulations 13 sub-section 4 and 65 sub-section 3 and Paragraphs 3, 4 and 105 of the Financial Instructions 1965, most of the government ministries have internal audit units. Each month, an internal audit report is prepared for each division of the ministry. The chief internal auditor consolidates these monthly reports every quarter for the attention of the Permanent Secretary only. There are no systematic arrangements to avail copies of those quarterly reports to the Ministry of Finance or the Auditor General, unless officials of the Treasury - Ministry of Finance and/or the Auditor General visit these ministries for their routing checks and external audits respectively.

(iii) Extent of management response to internal audit findings

There is a link between the effectiveness of PAC review of audit reports and management response to audit queries and findings, including internal audit findings. As noted in PI-26(iii), management response to recommended actions by the Auditor General is weak as a result of weak PAC reviews of audit reports. Available evidence attests to the fact that there are consistent breaches to financial regulations and procedures, as indicated in PI-21(i). Further, executive action will require a strong

political will, which is often missing with the current arrangement where there are no independent audit implementation committees without political interference.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sector	Score 2013	Justification for 2012 score
PI-21	Effectiveness of internal audit			
(i)	Coverage and quality of the internal audit function	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	C	Most MDAs have internal audit units but under staffed and with less qualified staff. Internal audit is mainly focused on compliance and financial audit, with little time (less than 20%) on systemic audit.
(ii)	Frequency and distribution of reports		C	Quarterly internal audit reports are only sent to the Permanent Secretaries of each ministry. No copies are formerly sent to the Ministry of Finance nor the Auditor General although these reports are available on request.
(iii)	Extent of management response to internal audit findings		C	Executive or management follow-up on internal audit recommendations is weak. There are consistent breaches referencing financial regulations and procedures
	Overall score		C	
(i)	Coverage and quality of the internal audit function	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	C	Most MDAs have internal audit units but under staffed and with less qualified staff. Internal audit is mainly focused on compliance and financial audit, with little time (less than 20%) on systemic audit.
(ii)	Frequency and distribution of reports		C	Quarterly internal audit reports are only sent to the Permanent Secretaries of each ministry. No copies are formerly sent to the Ministry of Finance nor the Auditor General although these reports are available on request.
(iii)	Extent of management response to internal audit findings		C	Executive or management follow-up on internal audit recommendations is weak. There are consistent breaches referencing financial regulations and procedures
	Overall score		C	
(i)	Coverage and quality of the internal audit function	Ministry of Energy	C	Most MDAs have internal audit units but under staffed and with less qualified staff. Internal audit is

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sector	Score 2013	Justification for 2012 score
		and Energy Affairs		mainly focused on compliance and financial audit, with little time (less than 20%) on systemic audit.
(ii)	Frequency and distribution of reports		C	Quarterly internal audit reports are only sent to the Permanent Secretaries of each ministry. No copies are formerly sent to the Ministry of Finance nor the Auditor General although these reports are available on request.
(iii)	Extent of management response to internal audit findings		C	Executive or management follow-up on internal audit recommendations is weak. There are consistent breaches referencing financial regulations and procedures
	Overall score		C	
(i)	Coverage and quality of the internal audit function	Ministry of Food Production	C	Most MDAs have internal audit units but under staffed and with less qualified staff. Internal audit is mainly focused on compliance and financial audit, with little time (less than 20%) on systemic audit.
(ii)	Frequency and distribution of reports		C	Quarterly internal audit reports are only sent to the Permanent Secretaries of each ministry. No copies are formerly sent to the Ministry of Finance nor the Auditor General although these reports are available on request.
(iii)	Extent of management response to internal audit findings		C	Executive or management follow-up on internal audit recommendations is weak. There are consistent breaches referencing financial regulations and procedures
	Overall score		C	
(i)	Coverage and quality of the internal audit function	Ministry of Environment and Water Resources	C	Most MDAs have internal audit units but under staffed and with less qualified staff. Internal audit is mainly focused on compliance and financial audit, with little time (less than 20%) on systemic audit.
(ii)	Frequency and distribution of reports		C	Quarterly internal audit report are only sent to the Permanent Secretaries of each ministry. No copies are formerly sent to the Ministry of Finance nor to the

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sector	Score 2013	Justification for 2012 score
				Auditor General although these reports are available on request.
(iii)	Extent of management response to internal audit findings		C	Executive or management follow-up on internal audit recommendations is weak. There are consistent breaches referencing financial regulations and procedures
	Overall score		C	

Ongoing reforms

There are no major reforms regarding changing from compliance audit to a more systems audit type of approach. However, there is work-in-progress on the draft internal audit manual to help improve internal audit.

3.5 Accounting, recording and reporting

3.5.1 PI-22 Timeliness and regularity of accounts reconciliation

(i) Regularity of bank reconciliations

The Treasury Single Account is operational in Trinidad and Tobago. All government banking transactions, both receipt and payment go through the treasury single system, with the exception of a few MDAs such as the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs that maintain bank account (kept at the Central Bank with legal basis as stated in Section 13(c) of the Exchequer and Audit Act) for internally generated funds. Monthly bank reconciliations are carried out by each MDA, following the submission of daily cheque return cards to the Treasury. Since bank reconciliations are dependent on the Treasury Department of the Ministry of Finance, any delays in forwarding individual ministries monthly banking transactions will have a negative impact on the timely completion of MDAs reconciliations. Even though monthly reconciliations are completed within 4 weeks after the end of the month once the Treasury has submitted the banking transaction lists to each MDA, officials from these MDAs confirmed that it could take as much as two months before the Treasury submits the banking returns, eventually delaying the reconciliation process. It should be noted that, there are strict guidelines referencing the opening and maintaining of government agencies bank accounts including donor bank account; available evidence suggests that all donor funds are transferred to the Treasury and co-mingled with government funds, going through the same reconciliation mechanism.

(ii) Regularity of reconciliation and clearance of suspense accounts and advances

The practice over the last three years and beyond has been the introduction of per diems for government officials on official duties as a mechanism to eliminate the usual practice of government officials failing to acquit any such advances for travel or other official government business. As part of the monthly expenditure returns and reconciliation process, un-acquitted cash advances are charged to the affected staff remuneration account.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-22	Timeliness and regularity of accounts reconciliation			Scoring Method M2.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
(i)	Regularity of Bank reconciliations	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	C	Monthly bank reconciliations take place within two months after the end of the month. It should be noted that MDAs could score a 'B' under this dimension since they actually complete the reconciliations within a month - the delay is as a result of the dependency on the Treasury
(ii)	Regularity of reconciliation and clearance of suspense accounts and advances		A	Advances and suspense accounts are cleared every month and un-acquitted balances charged to affected staff salary account
	Overall score		B	
(i)	Regularity of Bank reconciliations	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	C	Monthly bank reconciliations take place within two months after the end of the month. It should be noted that MDAs could score a 'B' under this dimension since they actually complete the reconciliations within a month - the delay is as a result of the dependency on the Treasury
(ii)	Regularity of reconciliation and clearance of suspense accounts and advances		A	Advances and suspense accounts are cleared every month and un-acquitted balances charged to affected staff salary account
	Overall score		B	
(i)	Regularity of Bank reconciliations	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	C	Monthly bank reconciliations take place within two months after the end of the month. It should be noted that MDAs could score a 'B' under this dimension since they actually complete the reconciliations within a month - the delay is as a result of the dependency on the Treasury
(ii)	Regularity of reconciliation and clearance of suspense accounts and advances		A	Advances and suspense accounts are cleared every month and un-acquitted balances charged to affected staff salary account
	Overall score		B	
(i)	Regularity of Bank reconciliations	Ministry of Food Production	C	Monthly bank reconciliations take place within two months after the end of the month. It should be noted that MDAs could score a 'B' under this dimension since they actually complete the reconciliations within a

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
				month - the delay is as a result of the dependency on the Treasury
(ii)	Regularity of reconciliation and clearance of suspense accounts and advances		A	Advances and suspense accounts are cleared every month and un-acquitted balances charged to affected staff salary account
	Overall score		B	
(i)	Regularity of Bank reconciliations	Ministry of Environment and Water Resources	C	Monthly bank reconciliations take place within two months after the end of the month. It should be noted that MDAs could score a 'B' under this dimension since they actually complete the reconciliations within a month - the delay is as a result of the dependency on the Treasury
(ii)	Regularity of reconciliation and clearance of suspense accounts and advances		A	Advances and suspense accounts are cleared every month and un-acquitted balances charged to affected staff salary account
	Overall score		B	

3.5.2 PI-23 Availability of information on resources received by service delivery units

Usually, a Public Expenditure Tracking Survey (PETS) or Public Expenditure Review is carried out for the large spending ministries such as education and health. None of the five MDAs under the EU budget support has undertaken such a survey. The accounting system in Trinidad and Tobago is manual, and would require a strenuous effort to attempt such an exercise. It turns out that majority of expenditure payments, even though committed at the spending units across the country, are sent to head office of the appropriate ministry in Port of Spain for payments to be made. This system, therefore is capable of some reasonable form of expenditure tracking by each spending unit; nonetheless this has not been institutionalised.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-23	Availability of information on resources received by service delivery units	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	D	No PETS nor PER has been conducted within the last three completed fiscal years. The current accounting system is manual and would require laborious effort to perform such an exercise. The expenditure payment system however, when institutionalised would be capable of tracking expenditures of each spending unit
		Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise	D	No PETS nor PER has been conducted within the last three completed fiscal years. The current accounting system is manual and would require laborious effort to perform such an exercise. The expenditure payment

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
		Development		system however, when institutionalised would be capable of tracking expenditures of each spending unit
		Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	D	No PETS nor PER has been conducted within the last three completed fiscal years. The current accounting system is manual and would require laborious effort to perform such an exercise. The expenditure payment system however, when institutionalised would be capable of tracking expenditures of each spending unit
		Ministry of Food Production	D	No PETS nor PER has been conducted within the last three completed fiscal years. The current accounting system is manual and would require laborious effort to perform such an exercise. The expenditure payment system however, when institutionalised would be capable of tracking expenditures of each spending unit
		Ministry of Environment and Water Resources	D	No PETS nor PER has been conducted within the last three completed fiscal years. The current accounting system is manual and would require laborious effort to perform such an exercise. The expenditure payment system however, when institutionalised would be capable of tracking expenditures of each spending unit

Ongoing reforms

Discussions are ongoing to migrate to IFMIS with a chart of account capable of tracking expenditure of each spending unit

3.5.3 PI-24 Quality and timeliness of in-year budget reports

(i) Scope of reports in terms of coverage and compatibility with budget estimates

Each ministry, department and agency prepares in-year budget execution reports. The reports are based on administrative and economic classifications with expenditure captured at both commitment and payment level, for both recurrent and development expenditure, which are consistent with the approved budget estimates, and allow for easy statistical and financial analyses. The reports are consistent over time. The in-year expenditure outturns also show the total vote allocated, how much is utilised, and the outstanding balance thereon.

(ii) Timeliness of the issue of reports

Monthly expenditure returns are prepared for submission to the Permanent Secretary, who is the accounting officer. A copy of the expenditure return is forwarded to the Ministry of Finance and the Economy Treasury and Budget Departments. Cash Releases to these ministries are subject to the preparation and submission of these monthly expenditure returns to the Finance Ministry. Officials

from ministries, including the sector relevant ministries indicated that these monthly reports are completed and submitted within four weeks after the end of the month. This was confirmed by Ministry of Finance as well as evidence obtained from extracts of dispatch books.

(iii) Quality of information

Ministries, departments and agencies do not separate bank accounts, with the exception of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs - one of the five ministries assessed under the EU sector budget support program, which falls under environmental governance. The Treasury Single Account is used for payment of all central government expenses. Once parliament approves the ministerial vote, general warrants are issued to these ministries indicating their commitment limits. Following the submission of annual cash flow to the Ministry of Finance, cash release warrants are issued to each ministry that allows them to commit expenditures. Cheques are issued for payment of expenditure against the cash release out of the Treasury Single Account held at the Central Bank of Trinidad and Tobago. A daily transaction return is submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts, which forms the basis of monthly reconciliations, which takes place within 4 weeks after the month end. This system of reconciliation reduces to the barest minimum any incidence of data inaccuracy used for the in-year budget execution reports

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-24	Quality and timeliness of in-year budget reports			Scoring Method M1.
(i)	Scope of reports in terms of coverage and compatibility with budget estimates	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	A	In-year execution reports are prepared, classified under administrative and economic at both commitment and payment level. These reports are consistent with the original approved budget estimates and consistent over time
(ii)	Timeliness of the issue of reports		A	Expenditure returns are prepared monthly and completed within two weeks after the end of the month
(iii)	Quality of information		A	The daily submission of cheque return sheets and the monthly reconciliation process allow for data integrity and accuracy.
	Overall score		A	
(i)	Scope of reports in terms of coverage and compatibility with budget estimates	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	A	In-year execution reports are prepared, classified under administrative and economic both at commitment and payment level. These reports are consistent with the original approved budget estimates and consistent over time
(ii)	Timeliness of the issue of reports		A	Expenditure returns are prepared monthly and completed within two weeks after the end of the month
(iii)	Quality of information		A	The daily submission of cheque return sheets and the monthly reconciliation process allow for data integrity and

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
				accuracy.
	Overall score		A	
(i)	Scope of reports in terms of coverage and compatibility with budget estimates	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	A	In-year execution reports are prepared, classified under administrative and economic both at commitment and payment level. These reports are consistent with the original approved budget estimates and consistent over time
(ii)	Timeliness of the issue of reports		A	Expenditure returns are prepares monthly and completed within two weeks after the end of the month
(iii)	Quality of information		A	The daily submission of cheque return sheets and the monthly reconciliation process allow for data integrity and accuracy.
	Overall score		A	
(i)	Scope of reports in terms of coverage and compatibility with budget estimates	Ministry of Food Production	A	In-year execution reports are prepared, classified under administrative and economic both at commitment and payment level. These reports are consistent with the original approved budget estimates and consistent over time
(ii)	Timeliness of the issue of reports		A	Expenditure returns are prepares monthly and completed within two weeks after the end of the month
(iii)	Quality of information		A	The daily submission of cheque return sheets and the monthly reconciliation process allow for data integrity and accuracy.
	Overall score		A	
(i)	Scope of reports in terms of coverage and compatibility with budget estimates	Ministry of Environment	A	In-year execution reports are prepared, classified under administrative and economic both at commitment and payment level. These reports are consistent with the original approved budget estimates and consistent over time
(ii)	Timeliness of the issue of reports		A	Expenditure returns are prepares monthly and completed within two weeks after the end of the month
(iii)	Quality of information		A	The daily submission of cheque return sheets and the monthly reconciliation process allow for data integrity and accuracy.
	Overall score		A	

Ongoing reforms

No reforms

3.5.4 PI-25 Quality and timeliness of annual financial statements

(i) Completeness of the financial statements

The Treasury Single Account is operational in Trinidad and Tobago. It adopts a centralised payment system for all government expenditure. Apart from the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs, which is legally authorised to maintain and operate a deposit account for internally generated funds (IGF), none of the four remaining MDAs under the sector PEFA assessment maintains a deposit account. Section 13 (c) of the Exchequer and Audit Act provides legal backing to the opening of such deposit bank account by the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs.

The Appropriations Act serves as the legal tool for central government spending. Each ministry, department and agency prepares an activity implementation schedule and a pro-forma cash flow forecast to the Ministry of Finance following the approval of budget estimates by Parliament, based on which quarterly general warrant and monthly cash release warrants are issued. Commitment control is done manually by the use of manual vote books following the receipt of general warrant and cash release warrant from the Ministry of Finance for recurrent expenditure. No commitments for expenditures are made without the cash warrant but with occasional minor breaches leading to informal practices. Where commitments are made without cash, a special official request is sought from the Ministry of Finance prior to making the said commitment. Therefore, there is an effective mechanism for monitoring and reporting outstanding commitments. Every month, an expenditure return is prepared using the manual vote book records and submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts. The Treasury sends a monthly cheque return sheet to each MDA for reconciliation with the manual vote ledger. At the end of each financial year, annual financial statements are prepared by each MDA with copies to the Treasury and the Auditor General. The annual financial statements provide a broad range of information, with the exception of a few missing information, as depicted in Table 3.13 below.

Table 3.13 Information Contained in the MDA Financial Statements

Financial heading	Sub-financial heading	Presence in Financial Statements
Revenue	Direct tax	Not Applicable
	Indirect tax	Not Applicable
	Non-tax revenue (incl. IGF)	Yes
	Grants	Yes
Expenditure & transfers	Personnel Emolument	Yes
	Administration	Yes
	Service	Yes
	Investments	Yes
	Statutory payments	Yes
	Subsidies	Yes
	Retained IGF	No, except for Ministry of Energy
	DP funded projects	Yes
Assets	Cash & Bank balances	Yes, held within Treasury Single Account
	Advances	Yes
	Public loans (receivable)	Yes
	Equity & other investments	Yes

Financial heading	Sub-financial heading	Presence in Financial Statements
	Revenue arrears	No
Liabilities	Public debts (domestic)	Yes
	Public debts (foreign)	Yes
	Statutory obligations	Yes
	Outstanding commitments	Yes
	Expenditure arrears	No

(ii) Timeliness of submission of the financial statements

Section 24 (1) (b) of the Exchequer and Audit Act Chapter 69:01 requires each accounting officer to prepare and submit annual financial statements of funds appropriated to him or her by Parliament, within a period of four months after the end of the financial year, to the Auditor General for audit. Table 3.14 below shows the actual submission dates of the annual financial statements of the five MDAs under the sector PEFA assessment. As per the legal requirements, the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs was a day and 23 days late in submitting its 2009/2010 and 2010/2011 annual financial statements respectively to the Auditor General. The Ministries of Labour and Environment were a day late in submitting their 2010/2011 annual financial statements to the Auditor General. In spite of these minor delays, all the five MDAs under the sector PEFA assessment did submit their annual financial statements to the Auditor General within 6 months after the end of the financial year during the last three completed financial years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012.

Table 3.14: Timeliness of submission of financial statements to the Auditor General

MDA	2009/2010	2010/2011	2011/2012
Ministry of Trade & Industry	31st January 2011	31st January 2012	31st January 2013
Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	31st January 2011	1st February 2012	31st January 2013
Ministry of Energy	1st February 2011	23rd February 2012	31st January 2013
Ministry of Food Production	31st January 2011	31st January 2012	31st January 2013
Ministry of Environment	31st January 2011	1st February 2012	31st January 2013

(iii) Accounting standards used

This dimension is not applicable to the sector assessment

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-25	Quality and timeliness of annual financial statements			Scoring Method M1.
(i)	Completeness of the financial statements	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	B	An annual financial statement is prepared and submitted to the Auditor General; the statements provide a broad range of financial information on revenue, expenditure, financial assets and liabilities with the exception of a few

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
(ii)	Timeliness of submission of the financial statements		A	In all three completed financial years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012, the annual financial statements were submitted to the Auditor General within 6 months after the end of the financial year
(iii)	Accounting standards used		Not Applicable to sector assessment	
	Overall score		B+	
(i)	Completeness of the financial statements	Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	B	An annual financial statement is prepared and submitted to the Auditor General; the statements provide a broad range of financial information on revenue, expenditure, financial assets and liabilities with the exception of a few
(ii)	Timeliness of submission of the financial statements		A	In all three completed financial years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012, the annual financial statements were submitted to the Auditor General within 6 months after the end of the financial year
(iii)	Accounting standards used		Not Applicable to sector assessment	
	Overall score		B+	
(i)	Completeness of the financial statements	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	B	An annual financial statement is prepared and submitted to the Auditor General; the statements provide a broad range of financial information on revenue, expenditure, financial assets and liabilities with the exception of a few
(ii)	Timeliness of submission of the financial statements		A	In all three completed financial years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012, the annual financial statements were submitted to the Auditor General within 6 months after the end of the financial year
(iii)	Accounting standards used		Not Applicable to sector assessment	
	Overall score		B+	
(i)	Completeness of the financial statements	Ministry of Food Production	B	An annual financial statement is prepared and submitted to the Auditor General; the statements provide a broad range of financial information

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
				on revenue, expenditure, financial assets and liabilities with the exception of a few
(ii)	Timeliness of submission of the financial statements		A	In all three completed financial years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012, the annual financial statements were submitted to the Auditor General within 6 months after the end of the financial year
(iii)	Accounting standards used		Not Applicable to sector assessment	
	Overall score		B+	
(i)	Completeness of the financial statements	Ministry of Environment	B	An annual financial statement is prepared and submitted to the Auditor General; the statements provide a broad range of financial information on revenue, expenditure, financial assets and liabilities with the exception of a few
(ii)	Timeliness of submission of the financial statements		A	In all three completed financial years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012, the annual financial statements were submitted to the Auditor General within 6 months after the end of the financial year
(iii)	Accounting standards used		Not Applicable to sector assessment	
	Overall score		B+	

3.6 External scrutiny and audit

3.6.1 PI-26 Scope, nature and follow-up of external audit

(i) Scope/nature of audit performed

This dimension is not applicable to the sector assessment

(ii) Timeliness of submission of audit reports to legislature

This dimension is not applicable to the sector assessment

(iii) Evidence of follow up on audit recommendations

Section 24(1) (b) of the Exchequer and Audit Act mandates all accounting officers in each ministry, department and agency to prepare and submit annual financial statements to the Auditor General four months after the end of the fiscal year. The Auditor General conducts her audit in accordance

with her audit work plan. Management letters are issued after the end of the fieldwork to enable accounting officers respond to audit queries, after which the audit report is finalised. The effectiveness of follow-up on audit recommendations hinges on a strong and effective Public Accounts Committee of Parliament. As presented below, the repeat of audit findings and recommendations by the Auditor General underscores the weak regime of follow-up of audit recommendations in the last three completed fiscal years. Some of the key audit issues are as follow:

- Outstanding commitments not submitted to the Auditor General
- Particulars of trust or other moneys held
- Particulars of donations (cash or kind) received
- Contract documents to service providers and contract staff
- Overpayments to service providers

The Auditor General has raised serious concerns referencing overpayments to service providers by ministries, departments and agencies. Table 3.15 provides a summary of the five MDAs under the EU sector budget support with issues on overpayment to service providers.

Table 3.15: MDAs Overpayment Schedule

MDA	2010/2011			2011/2012		
	Overpayment	Recovery	Balance	Overpayment	Recovery	Balance
Ministry of Trade & Industry	51,266.00	31,378.00	19,888.00	-	-	-
Ministry of Labour, Small & Micro Entp Dev	105,100.00	93,315.00	11,785.00	169,098.00	105,774.00	63,324.00
Ministry of Energy & Energy Affairs	30,974.00	-	30,974.00	-	-	-
Ministry of Food Production	206,318.00	179,991.00	26,327.00	-	-	-
Ministry of Environment	19,274.00	19,274.00	-	-	-	-

Source: Auditor General's Report 2010/2011 & 2011/2012

It is also of importance to note some compliance issues raised by the Auditor General in her 2009/2010 to 2011/2012 reports of MDAs. Of relevance to the sector assessment are five MDAs, the summary of which is shown in Table 3.16 below.

Table 3.16: Compliance Concerns

MDA	Compliance Issues				
	Keeping other bank accounts	Improper reconciliations	Payments without supplies	Contract irregularities	Transfers & subsidies without proper documentation
Ministry of Trade					Yes
Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development		Yes			
Ministry of Energy	Yes, with legal backing			Yes	
Ministry of Food Production			Yes		

Ministry of Environment		Yes			
-------------------------	--	-----	--	--	--

Source: Auditor General's Reports 2009/2010 to 2011/2012

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
PI-26	Scope, nature and follow-up of external audit			Scoring Method M1
(i)	Scope/nature of audit performed (including adherence to auditing standards)	Not Applicable to sector assessment		
(ii)	Timeliness of submission of audit reports to the legislature	Not Applicable to sector assessment		
(iii)	Evidence of follow-up on audit recommendations	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	C	Even though audit recommendations are made, the delay in PAC's review of Auditor General's reports impedes implementation of recommended actions. There is little evidence of executive follow-up
		Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development,	C	Even though audit recommendations are made, the delay in PAC's review of Auditor General's reports impedes implementation of recommended actions. There is little evidence of executive follow-up
		Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	C	Even though audit recommendations are made, the delay in PAC's review of Auditor General's reports impedes implementation of recommended actions. There is little evidence of executive follow-up
		Ministry of Food Production	C	Even though audit recommendations are made, the delay in PAC's review of Auditor General's reports impedes implementation of recommended actions. There is little evidence of executive follow-up
		Ministry of Environment	C	Even though audit recommendations are made, the delay in PAC's review of Auditor General's reports impedes implementation of recommended actions. There is little evidence of executive follow-up

Ongoing reforms

No reforms

3.7 Donor practices

3.7.1 D-2 Financial information provided by donors for budgeting and reporting on project and program aid

(i) Completeness and timeliness of budget estimates by donors for project support

The European Union (EU) and the Inter-American Development Bank (IADB) - the two major donors - provide development assistance to the Government of Trinidad and Tobago through sector budget support. In addition, these donors provide program and project aid, paid directly by the donors, within the various sectors of the economy. Each MDA budget and for that matter the national budget should provide complete revenue and expenditure estimates in order to ascertain the efficiency and effectiveness of service delivery.

In practice, however, Ministries Departments and Agencies do not have the full complement of the total sector budget support estimates for inclusion into the MDA/sector budget estimates submitted to the Ministry of Finance and the Economy. Donors, nonetheless inform MDAs referencing the type of assistance to be provided prior to finalising the contract dossiers for programs and projects.

(ii) Frequency and coverage of reporting by donors on actual donor flows for project support

At present, none of the major donors provide financial reports regarding the actual expenditure on all program and project support paid for directly by the donors; the total expenditure incurred and paid for instance, for technical assistance and aid in kind are not reported to the MDAs and the Ministry of Finance. As it turns out, it is not possible for each MDA or the Ministry of Finance to ascertain its complete financial position, since the total actual expenditure incurred and paid on projects and programs are not reported by the donors.

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
D-2	Financial information provided by donors for budgeting and reporting on project and program aid			Scoring Method 1
(i)	Completeness and timeliness of budget estimates by donors for project support	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	D	None of the major donors provide budget estimates of total project and program aid support
(ii)	Frequency and coverage of reporting by donors on actual donor flows for project support		D	None of the major donors provide financial reports on actual expenditure incurred and paid for projects and program support
	Overall score		D	
(i)	Completeness and timeliness of budget estimates by donors for	Ministry of Labour and	D	None of the major donors provide budget estimates of total project and program aid support

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
	project support	Small and Micro Enterprise Development		
(ii)	Frequency and coverage of reporting by donors on actual donor flows for project support		D	None of the major donors provide financial reports on actual expenditure incurred and paid for projects and program support
	Overall score		D	
(i)	Completeness and timeliness of budget estimates by donors for project support	Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs	D	None of the major donors provide budget estimates of total project and program aid support
(ii)	Frequency and coverage of reporting by donors on actual donor flows for project support		D	None of the major donors provide financial reports on actual expenditure incurred and paid for projects and program support
	Overall score		D	
(i)	Completeness and timeliness of budget estimates by donors for project support	Ministry of Food Production	D	None of the major donors provide budget estimates of total project and program aid support
(ii)	Frequency and coverage of reporting by donors on actual donor flows for project support		D	None of the major donors provide financial reports on actual expenditure incurred and paid for projects and program support
	Overall score		D	
(i)	Completeness and timeliness of budget estimates by donors for project support	Ministry of Environment	D	None of the major donors provide budget estimates of total project and program aid support
(ii)	Frequency and coverage of reporting by donors on actual donor flows for project support		D	None of the major donors provide financial reports on actual expenditure incurred and paid for projects and program support
	Overall score		D	

Ongoing reforms:

No reforms

3.7.2 D-3 Proportion of aid that is managed by use of national procedures

At the Paris Declaration 2005, the Accra Agenda for Action 2008 and the Busan Action Plan 2011, donors agreed to use country systems in providing development aid to countries in consonance with national systems. The use of country systems and procedures is defined as adopting the use of national procurement laws and procedures, disbursement of funds through the national treasury system, accounting and reporting for the use of these funds through national accounting policies

and procedures, and auditing the use of these funds by adopting national auditing standards and procedures.

As presented in Table 3.17 below, the major donors have significantly improved the use of national systems in aid modality. During the three years under review, while IADB provided policy-based loans and sector budget support, the EU's budget support was more sector driven; nonetheless, all disbursements from both donors were made to the national treasury. More than 90% of total aid to Trinidad and Tobago used national PFM systems.

Table 3.17: Use of country PFM and Procurement Systems

	Total Direct BS (USD million)	Total program/project (USD million)	Total Aid (USD million)	Use of country systems				
				Procurement	Budget execution	Financial reporting	Audit	Weighted average
2009/10								
IADB	5.98	0.00	5.98	5.98	5.98	5.98	5.98	
	0.00	0.10	0.10	0.00	0.0	0.00	0.00	
EU	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
	0.00	0.54	0.54	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
Total	5.98	0.64	6.62	5.98	5.98	5.98	5.98	90.33%
2010/11								
IADB	18.87	0.00	18.87	18.87	18.87	18.87	18.87	
	0.00	0.10	0.10	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
EU	64.37	0.00	64.37	64.37	64.37	64.37	64.37	
	0.00	0.35	0.35	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
Total	83.24	0.45	83.69	83.24	83.24	83.24	83.24	99.46%
2011/12								
IADB	41.46	0.00	41.46	41.46	41.46	41.46	41.46	
	0.00	0.10	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
EU	13.79	0.00	13.79	13.79	13.79	13.79	13.79	
	0.00	1.03	1.03	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	
Total	55.25	1.13	56.28	55.25	55.25	55.25	55.25	98.17%

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
D-3	Overall proportion of aid funds to central government that are managed through national procedures	Ministry of Trade, Industry and Investment	A	More than 90% of total donor aid to Trinidad and Tobago used country systems. The actual percentage usage was 90.33%, 99.46% and 98.17% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
		Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development	A	More than 90% of total donor aid to Trinidad and Tobago used country systems. The actual percentage usage was 90.33%, 99.46% and 98.17% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
		Ministry of Energy and	A	More than 90% of total donor aid to Trinidad and Tobago used country systems. The

PI	Dimension	MDAs/Sectors	Score 2013	Justification for 2013 score
		Energy Affairs		actual percentage usage was 90.33%, 99.46% and 98.17% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
		Ministry of Food Production	A	More than 90% of total donor aid to Trinidad and Tobago used country systems. The actual percentage usage was 90.33%, 99.46% and 98.17% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
		Ministry of Environment	A	More than 90% of total donor aid to Trinidad and Tobago used country systems. The actual percentage usage was 90.33%, 99.46% and 98.17% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively

Ongoing reforms

No reforms

Annexes

Annex 1: PFM Performance Measurement Framework Indicators Summary: Sectors

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
A.	PFM OUT-TURNS: Credibility of the budget										
PI-1	Aggregate expenditure out-turn compared to original approved budget	D	B	D	D	D	In all the last three completed fiscal years, aggregate expenditure deviations were more than 15% between primary original budget and primary outturn. Actual deviations were 15.9%, -15.5% and -55.1% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	In two of the last three completed fiscal years, aggregate expenditure deviation was below 10% between primary original budget and primary outturn. Actual deviations were 7.0%, 5.9% and -0.4% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	In all the last three completed fiscal years, aggregate expenditure deviations were more than 15% between primary original budget and primary outturn. Actual deviations were 7.4%, 16.5% and 15.7% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	In all the last three completed fiscal years, aggregate expenditure deviations were more than 15% between primary original budget and primary outturn. Actual deviations were -41.7%, 5.1% and -35.6% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	In all the last three completed fiscal years, aggregate expenditure deviations were more than 15% between primary original budget and primary outturn. Actual deviations were 17.1%, 1.3% and 16.0% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
PI-3	Aggregate revenue out-turn compared to original approved budget	D	D	D	C	D	Actual revenue outturns were 26.39%, 100% and 100% above estimates for 2009/2010,	Actual revenue outturns were 19.86% and 1.45% above estimates for 2009/2010 and 2010/2011	Actual revenue outturns were 87.19%, 60% and 38% below estimates for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012	Actual revenue outturn was 3.25% and 8.42% above estimates for 2010/2011 and 2011/2012	Actual revenue outturns were 44.08%, 81.48% and 46% below estimates for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively.	respectively. In 2011/2012 outturns were 8.62% below forecast	respectively.	respectively. In 2009/2010, the outturns were 37.16% above forecast.	respectively.
PI-4	Stock and Monitoring of Expenditure Payment Arrears										
PI-4(i)	Stock of expenditure payment arrears (as a percentage of total expenditure)	A	A	A	A	A	Stock of commitment arrears are below 2% of total expenditure, which suggests a low level of expenditure arrears. The actual levels are 0.20%, 0.01% and 0.00% of total expenditure for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	Stock of commitment arrears are below 2% of total expenditure, which suggests a low level of expenditure arrears. The actual levels are 0.04%, 0.04% and 0.00% of total expenditure for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	Stock of commitment arrears are below 2% of total expenditure, which suggests a low level of expenditure arrears. The actual levels are 0.31%, 0.2% and 0.3% of total expenditure for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	Stock of commitment arrears are below 2% of total expenditure, which suggests a low level of expenditure arrears. The actual levels are 0.46%, 0.42% and 0.07% of total expenditure for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	Stock of commitment arrears are below 2% of total expenditure, which suggests a low level of expenditure arrears. The actual levels are 1.47%, 0.22% and 0.02% of total expenditure for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively
PI-4(ii)	Availability of data for monitoring the stock of expenditure payment arrears	B	B	B	B	B	A monthly and an annual commitment schedule is generated and submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts and the Auditor General;	A monthly and an annual commitment schedule is generated and submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts and the Auditor General; however, the schedule	A monthly and an annual commitment schedule is generated and submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts and the Auditor General; however, the schedule	A monthly and an annual commitment schedule is generated and submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts and the Auditor General;	A monthly and an annual commitment schedule is generated and submitted to the Comptroller of Accounts and the Auditor General; however, the schedule

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							however, the schedule does not include an ageing report. There is no report on expenditure arrears	does not include an ageing report. There is no report on expenditure arrears	does not include an ageing report. There is no report on expenditure arrears	however, the schedule does not include an ageing report. There is no report on expenditure arrears	does not include an ageing report. There is no report on expenditure arrears
B.	KEY CROSS-CUTTING ISSUES: Comprehensiveness and transparency										
PI-5	Classification of the budget	C	C	C	C	C	The budget is classified under sub-administrative and economic headings. Financial reporting is consistent with the budget classification	The budget is classified under sub-administrative and economic headings. Financial reporting is consistent with the budget classification	The budget is classified under sub-administrative and economic headings. Financial reporting is consistent with the budget classification	The budget is classified under sub-administrative and economic headings. Financial reporting is consistent with the budget classification	The budget is classified under sub-administrative and economic headings. Financial reporting is consistent with the budget classification
PI-7	Extent of Unreported Government Operations										
PI-7(i)	The level of extra-budgetary expenditure (other than donor funded projects)	A	A	A	A	A	MDAs budget for all revenue estimates and report on all expenditure incurred. There are no PPPs at present. The level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure, if any, is very insignificant.	MDAs budget for all revenue estimates and report on all expenditure incurred. There are no PPPs at present. The level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure, if any, is very insignificant.	MDAs budget for all revenue estimates and report on all expenditure incurred. There are no PPPs at present. The level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure, if any, is very insignificant.	MDAs budget for all revenue estimates and report on all expenditure incurred. There are no PPPs at present. The level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure, if any, is very insignificant.	MDAs budget for all revenue estimates and report on all expenditure incurred. There are no PPPs at present. The level of unreported extra-budgetary expenditure, if any, is very insignificant.
PI-7(ii)	Income/expenditure information on donor funded projects included in fiscal report	A	A	A	A	A	More than 90% of donor support is done through the	More than 90% of donor support is done through the National	More than 90% of donor support is done through the National	More than 90% of donor support is done through the	More than 90% of donor support is done through the National

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							National Treasury, thereby using national PFM systems. Other donor program and project support, such as Technical Assistance is very insignificant (below 1% of total MDA expenditure)	Treasury, thereby using national PFM systems. Other donor program and project support, such as Technical Assistance is very insignificant (below 1% of total MDA expenditure)	Treasury, thereby using national PFM systems. Other donor program and project support, such as Technical Assistance is very insignificant (below 1% of total MDA expenditure)	National Treasury, thereby using national PFM systems. Other donor program and project support, such as Technical Assistance is very insignificant (below 1% of total MDA expenditure)	Treasury, thereby using national PFM systems. Other donor program and project support, such as Technical Assistance is very insignificant (below 1% of total MDA expenditure)
C.	BUDGET CYCLE										
C(i)	Policy-based Budgeting										
PI-11	Orderliness and participation in the annual budget process										
PI-11 (i)	Existence of and adherence to a fixed budget calendar	A	A	A	A	A	A clear budget circular exist. Copies of the same circular from MoFE are distributed to each division of MDA. Each division has about two weeks to prepare their budget estimates; however, a total of two months is given to each MDA to prepare and submit estimates to MoFE	A clear budget circular exist. Copies of the same circular from MoFE are distributed to each division of MDA. Each division has about two weeks to prepare their budget estimates; however, a total of two months is given to each MDA to prepare and submit estimates to MoFE	A clear budget circular exist. Copies of the same circular from MoFE are distributed to each division of MDA. Each division has about two weeks to prepare their budget estimates; however, a total of two months is given to each MDA to prepare and submit estimates to MoFE	A clear budget circular exist. Copies of the same circular from MoFE are distributed to each division of MDA. Each division has about two weeks to prepare their budget estimates; however, a total of two months is given to each MDA to prepare and submit estimates to MoFE	A clear budget circular exist. Copies of the same circular from MoFE are distributed to each division of MDA. Each division has about two weeks to prepare their budget estimates; however, a total of two months is given to each MDA to prepare and submit estimates to MoFE

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
PI-11 (ii)	Guidance on the Preparation of budget submissions	D	D	D	D	D	A budget circular is issued to each MDA and copies are distributed to each MDA division. However, the circulars have no budget ceilings to guide the budget estimates leading to preparation and submission of 'wish lists'	A budget circular is issued to each MDA and copies are distributed to each MDA division. However, the circulars have no budget ceilings to guide the budget estimates leading to preparation and submission of 'wish lists'	A budget circular is issued to each MDA and copies are distributed to each MDA division. However, the circulars have no budget ceilings to guide the budget estimates leading to preparation and submission of 'wish lists'	A budget circular is issued to each MDA and copies are distributed to each MDA division. However, the circulars have no budget ceilings to guide the budget estimates leading to preparation and submission of 'wish lists'	A budget circular is issued to each MDA and copies are distributed to each MDA division. However, the circulars have no budget ceilings to guide the budget estimates leading to preparation and submission of 'wish lists'
PI-11 (iii)	Timely budget approval by the legislature	B	B	B	B	B	In two of the last three completed fiscal years 2009/2010 and 2011/2012, the legislature approved the budget estimates before the end of the fiscal year	In two of the last three completed fiscal years 2009/2010 and 2011/2012, the legislature approved the budget estimates before the end of the fiscal year	In two of the last three completed fiscal years 2009/2010 and 2011/2012, the legislature approved the budget estimates before the end of the fiscal year	In two of the last three completed fiscal years 2009/2010 and 2011/2012, the legislature approved the budget estimates before the end of the fiscal year	In two of the last three completed fiscal years 2009/2010 and 2011/2012, the legislature approved the budget estimates before the end of the fiscal year
PI-12	Multi-year perspective in fiscal planning, expenditure policy and budgeting										
PI-12 (iii)	Existence of costed sector strategies	D	D	D	D	D	Strategic plans are prepared over a three-year period, linked to the Medium Term Police	Strategic plans are prepared over a three-year period, linked to the Medium Term Police Framework.	Strategic plans are prepared over a three-year period, linked to the Medium Term Police Framework.	Strategic plans are prepared over a three-year period, linked to the Medium Term Police	Strategic plans are prepared over a three-year period, linked to the Medium Term Police Framework.

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							Framework. However, they not costed having investment and forward linked recurrent cost perspective	However, they not costed having investment and forward linked recurrent cost perspective	However, they not costed having investment and forward linked recurrent cost perspective	Framework. However, they not costed having investment and forward linked recurrent cost perspective	However, they not costed having investment and forward linked recurrent cost perspective
PI-12 (iv)	Linkages between investment budgets	D	D	D	D	D	There are no linkages between investment cost and forward linked recurrent budget estimates; where they exist, the link is very weak	There are no linkages between investment cost and forward linked recurrent budget estimates; where they exist, the link is very weak	There are no linkages between investment cost and forward linked recurrent budget estimates; where they exist, the link is very weak	There are no linkages between investment cost and forward linked recurrent budget estimates; where they exist, the link is very weak	There are no linkages between investment cost and forward linked recurrent budget estimates; where they exist, the link is very weak
C(ii)	Predictability and control in Budget Execution										
PI-16	Predictability in the Availability of Funds for Commitment of Expenditure										
PI-16 (i)	Extent to which cash flows are forecast and monitored	A	A	A	A	A	An annual cash flow statement is prepared together with an activity implementation plan (procurement plan) with the full complement of approved estimates. The cash flow statement is updated	An annual cash flow statement is prepared together with an activity implementation plan (procurement plan) with the full complement of approved estimates. The cash flow statement is updated each month in line	An annual cash flow statement is prepared together with an activity implementation plan (procurement plan) with the full complement of approved estimates. The cash flow statement is updated each month in line	An annual cash flow statement is prepared together with an activity implementation plan (procurement plan) with the full complement of approved estimates. The cash flow statement is	An annual cash flow statement is prepared together with an activity implementation plan (procurement plan) with the full complement of approved estimates. The cash flow statement is updated

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE &EA	MoLS MED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							each month in line with the activity progress report	with the activity progress report	with the activity progress report	updated each month in line with the activity progress report	each month in line with the activity progress report
PI-17	Recording and Management of Cash Balances, Debt and Guarantees										
PI-17(ii)	Extent of consolidation of the government's cash balances	A	A	A	A	A	MDAs do not operate separate bank accounts, with the exception of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs for IGF, mandated by the EAA. Daily banks statements are issued by the Central Bank for the reconciliation of the Treasury Single Account by the Comptroller of Accounts. MDAs also prepare daily cheque return cards and submit to the Treasury for reconciliation; this allows each MDA as well as the National	MDAs do not operate separate bank accounts, with the exception of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs for IGF, mandated by the EAA. Daily banks statements are issued by the Central Bank for the reconciliation of the Treasury Single Account by the Comptroller of Accounts. MDAs also prepare daily cheque return cards and submit to the Treasury for reconciliation; this allows each MDA as well as the National Treasury to ascertain the daily cash	MDAs do not operate separate bank accounts, with the exception of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs for IGF, mandated by the EAA. Daily banks statements are issued by the Central Bank for the reconciliation of the Treasury Single Account by the Comptroller of Accounts. MDAs also prepare daily cheque return cards and submit to the Treasury for reconciliation; this allows each MDA as well as the National Treasury to ascertain the daily cash	MDAs do not operate separate bank accounts, with the exception of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs for IGF, mandated by the EAA. Daily banks statements are issued by the Central Bank for the reconciliation of the Treasury Single Account by the Comptroller of Accounts. MDAs also prepare daily cheque return cards and submit to the Treasury for reconciliation; this allows each MDA as well as the National Treasury to ascertain the daily cash	MDAs do not operate separate bank accounts, with the exception of the Ministry of Energy and Energy Affairs for IGF, mandated by the EAA. Daily banks statements are issued by the Central Bank for the reconciliation of the Treasury Single Account by the Comptroller of Accounts. MDAs also prepare daily cheque return cards and submit to the Treasury for reconciliation; this allows each MDA as well as the National Treasury to ascertain the daily cash

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							Treasury to ascertain the daily cash balance.	balance.	balance.	Treasury to ascertain the daily cash balance.	balance.
PI-18	Effectiveness of payroll controls										
PI-18(i)	Degree of integration and reconciliation between personnel records and payroll data	A	A	A	A	A	Payroll is managed centrally through the IHRIS platform, which has a three-link interface - establishment, personnel and payroll databases. The personnel database is linked to the payroll database and assures of effective control. Monthly staff checks are done to reconcile post with personnel and payroll	Payroll is managed centrally through the IHRIS platform, which has a three-link interface - establishment, personnel and payroll databases. The personnel database is linked to the payroll database and assures of effective control. Monthly staff checks are done to reconcile post with personnel and payroll	Payroll is managed centrally through the IHRIS platform, which has a three-link interface - establishment, personnel and payroll databases. The personnel database is linked to the payroll database and assures of effective control. Monthly staff checks are done to reconcile post with personnel and payroll	Payroll is managed centrally through the IHRIS platform, which has a three-link interface - establishment, personnel and payroll databases. The personnel database is linked to the payroll database and assures of effective control. Monthly staff checks are done to reconcile post with personnel and payroll	Payroll is managed centrally through the IHRIS platform, which has a three-link interface - establishment, personnel and payroll databases. The personnel database is linked to the payroll database and assures of effective control. Monthly staff checks are done to reconcile post with personnel and payroll
PI-18(ii)	Timeliness of changes to personnel records and the payroll	B	B	B	B	B	Changes to personnel database takes place within two to three months following detection and approval of changes	Changes to personnel database takes place within two to three months following detection and approval of changes	Changes to personnel database takes place within two to three months following detection and approval of changes	Changes to personnel database takes place within two to three months following detection and approval of changes	Changes to personnel database takes place within two to three months following detection and approval of changes
PI-18(iii)	Internal controls of changes to	A	A	A	A	A	IHRIS platform is	IHRIS platform is	IHRIS platform is	IHRIS platform is	IHRIS platform is

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
	personnel records and the payroll						capable of generating audit trails that identified entry date and time as well as authorised staff with the necessary passwords.	capable of generating audit trails that identified entry date and time as well as authorised staff with the necessary passwords.	capable of generating audit trails that identified entry date and time as well as authorised staff with the necessary passwords.	capable of generating audit trails that identified entry date and time as well as authorised staff with the necessary passwords.	capable of generating audit trails that identified entry date and time as well as authorised staff with the necessary passwords.
PI-18(iv)	Existence of payroll audits to identify control weaknesses and/or ghost workers	C	C	C	C	C	Even though payroll audits have not been carried out within the last three completed fiscal years, regular monthly staff returns serve as a good proxy for payroll audit. Each supervisor submits the monthly staff return to the MDA head office.	Even though payroll audits have not been carried out within the last three completed fiscal years, regular monthly staff returns serve as a good proxy for payroll audit. Each supervisor submits the monthly staff return to the MDA head office.	Even though payroll audits have not been carried out within the last three completed fiscal years, regular monthly staff returns serve as a good proxy for payroll audit. Each supervisor submits the monthly staff return to the MDA head office.	Even though payroll audits have not been carried out within the last three completed fiscal years, regular monthly staff returns serve as a good proxy for payroll audit. Each supervisor submits the monthly staff return to the MDA head office.	Even though payroll audits have not been carried out within the last three completed fiscal years, regular monthly staff returns serve as a good proxy for payroll audit. Each supervisor submits the monthly staff return to the MDA head office.
PI-19	Competition, value for money and controls in procurement										
PI-19(i)	Transparency, comprehensiveness and competition in the legal and regulatory framework	C	C	C	C	C	The CTB Ordinance No 22 1961 meets only three out of the six elements of the legal and regulatory framework for	The CTB Ordinance No 22 1961 meets only three out of the six elements of the legal and regulatory framework for	The CTB Ordinance No 22 1961 meets only three out of the six elements of the legal and regulatory framework for	The CTB Ordinance No 22 1961 meets only three out of the six elements of the legal and regulatory framework for	The CTB Ordinance No 22 1961 meets only three out of the six elements of the legal and regulatory framework for

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							international best practices, which is adopted by MDAs	international best practices, which is adopted by MDAs	international best practices, which is adopted by MDAs	international best practices, which is adopted by MDAs	international best practices, which is adopted by MDAs
PI-19 (ii)	Use of competitive procurement methods	D	D	D	D	D	There is no data on total value of contracts awarded using sole sourcing or restricted tender.	There is no data on total value of contracts awarded using sole sourcing or restricted tender.	There is no data on total value of contracts awarded using sole sourcing or restricted tender.	There is no data on total value of contracts awarded using sole sourcing or restricted tender.	There is no data on total value of contracts awarded using sole sourcing or restricted tender.
PI-19 (iii)	Public access to complete, reliable and timely procurement information	D	D	D	D	D	MDAs do not have a systematic mechanism for making available full procurement information to the public. Detailed procurement plans, bidding opportunities and complaint resolutions are not completely public notice	MDAs do not have a systematic mechanism for making available full procurement information to the public. Detailed procurement plans, bidding opportunities and complaint resolutions are not completely public notice	MDAs do not have a systematic mechanism for making available full procurement information to the public. Detailed procurement plans, bidding opportunities and complaint resolutions are not completely public notice	MDAs do not have a systematic mechanism for making available full procurement information to the public. Detailed procurement plans, bidding opportunities and complaint resolutions are not completely public notice	MDAs do not have a systematic mechanism for making available full procurement information to the public. Detailed procurement plans, bidding opportunities and complaint resolutions are not completely public notice
PI-19 (iv)	Existence of an independent administrative procurement complaints system	D	D	D	D	D	There is no independent procurement complaints mechanism. Any complaint filed by a disgruntled bidder is investigated by the same board	There is no independent procurement complaints mechanism. Any complaint filed by a disgruntled bidder is investigated by the same board members	There is no independent procurement complaints mechanism. Any complaint filed by a disgruntled bidder is investigated by the same board members	There is no independent procurement complaints mechanism. Any complaint filed by a disgruntled bidder is investigated by the same board	There is no independent procurement complaints mechanism. Any complaint filed by a disgruntled bidder is investigated by the same board members

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE &EA	MoLS MED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							members of the CTB	of the CTB	of the CTB	members of the CTB	of the CTB
PI-20	Effectiveness of internal control for non-salary expenditure										
PI-20(i)	Effectiveness of expenditure commitment controls	B	B	B	B	B	Expenditure is committed only when cash release warrants are received from the Ministry of Finance. The manual vote book in each spending unit is used to effectively control spending limits. This is much more effective for development expenditure, with minor breached referencing recurrent expenditure	Expenditure is committed only when cash release warrants are received from the Ministry of Finance. The manual vote book in each spending unit is used to effectively control spending limits. This is much more effective for development expenditure, with minor breached referencing recurrent expenditure	Expenditure is committed only when cash release warrants are received from the Ministry of Finance. The manual vote book in each spending unit is used to effectively control spending limits. This is much more effective for development expenditure, with minor breached referencing recurrent expenditure	Expenditure is committed only when cash release warrants are received from the Ministry of Finance. The manual vote book in each spending unit is used to effectively control spending limits. This is much more effective for development expenditure, with minor breached referencing recurrent expenditure	Expenditure is committed only when cash release warrants are received from the Ministry of Finance. The manual vote book in each spending unit is used to effectively control spending limits. This is much more effective for development expenditure, with minor breached referencing recurrent expenditure
PI-20(ii)	Comprehensiveness, relevance and understanding of other internal control rules/procedures	C	C	C	C	C	Internal controls are comprehensive as contained in the Treasury Accounting Manual; however, constant staff reshuffle as well as high staff turnover	Internal controls are comprehensive as contained in the Treasury Accounting Manual; however, constant staff reshuffle as well as high staff turnover affects the	Internal controls are comprehensive as contained in the Treasury Accounting Manual; however, constant staff reshuffle as well as high staff turnover affects the	Internal controls are comprehensive as contained in the Treasury Accounting Manual; however, constant staff reshuffle as well as high staff turnover	Internal controls are comprehensive as contained in the Treasury Accounting Manual; however, constant staff reshuffle as well as high staff turnover affects the

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							affects the understanding of these rules	understanding of these rules	understanding of these rules	affects the understanding of these rules	understanding of these rules
PI-20(iii)	Degree of compliance with rules for processing and recording transactions	C	C	C	C	C	Clear and succinct internal controls rules and procedures exist and are generally adhered to with some breaches referencing procurement rules, payment for supplies, among others, becoming an issue of concern as reported by the Auditor General	Clear and succinct internal controls rules and procedures exist and are generally adhered to with some breaches referencing procurement rules, payment for supplies, among others, becoming an issue of concern as reported by the Auditor General	Clear and succinct internal controls rules and procedures exist and are generally adhered to with some breaches referencing procurement rules, payment for supplies, among others, becoming an issue of concern as reported by the Auditor General	Clear and succinct internal controls rules and procedures exist and are generally adhered to with some breaches referencing procurement rules, payment for supplies, among others, becoming an issue of concern as reported by the Auditor General	Clear and succinct internal controls rules and procedures exist and are generally adhered to with some breaches referencing procurement rules, payment for supplies, among others, becoming an issue of concern as reported by the Auditor General
PI-21	Effectiveness of internal audit										
PI-21 (i)	Coverage and quality of the internal audit function	C	C	C	C	C	Most MDAs have internal audit units but under staffed and less qualified staff. Internal audit is mainly focused on compliance and financial audit, with little time (less than 20%) on systemic audit.	Most MDAs have internal audit units but under staffed and less qualified staff. Internal audit is mainly focused on compliance and financial audit, with little time (less than 20%) on systemic audit.	Most MDAs have internal audit units but under staffed and less qualified staff. Internal audit is mainly focused on compliance and financial audit, with little time (less than 20%) on systemic audit.	Most MDAs have internal audit units but under staffed and less qualified staff. Internal audit is mainly focused on compliance and financial audit, with little time (less than 20%) on systemic audit.	Most MDAs have internal audit units but under staffed and less qualified staff. Internal audit is mainly focused on compliance and financial audit, with little time (less than 20%) on systemic audit.

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE &EA	MoLS MED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
PI-21 (ii)	Frequency and distribution of reports	C	C	C	C	C	Quarterly internal audit reports are only sent to the Permanent Secretaries of each ministry. No copies are formerly sent to the Ministry of Finance nor the Auditor General although these reports are available on request.	Quarterly internal audit reports are only sent to the Permanent Secretaries of each ministry. No copies are formerly sent to the Ministry of Finance nor the Auditor General although these reports are available on request.	Quarterly internal audit reports are only sent to the Permanent Secretaries of each ministry. No copies are formerly sent to the Ministry of Finance nor the Auditor General although these reports are available on request.	Quarterly internal audit reports are only sent to the Permanent Secretaries of each ministry. No copies are formerly sent to the Ministry of Finance nor the Auditor General although these reports are available on request.	Quarterly internal audit reports are only sent to the Permanent Secretaries of each ministry. No copies are formerly sent to the Ministry of Finance nor the Auditor General although these reports are available on request.
PI-21 (iii)	Extent of management response to internal audit findings	C	C	C	C	C	Executive or management follow-up on internal audit recommendations are weak, the reason for which there are consistent breaches referencing financial regulations and procedures	Executive or management follow-up on internal audit recommendations are weak, the reason for which there are consistent breaches referencing financial regulations and procedures	Executive or management follow-up on internal audit recommendations are weak, the reason for which there are consistent breaches referencing financial regulations and procedures	Executive or management follow-up on internal audit recommendations are weak, the reason for which there are consistent breaches referencing financial regulations and procedures	Executive or management follow-up on internal audit recommendations are weak, the reason for which there are consistent breaches referencing financial regulations and procedures
C(iii)	Accounting, Recording and Reporting										
PI-22	Timeliness and regularity of accounts reconciliation										
PI-22(i)	Regularity of bank reconciliation	C	C	C	C	C	Monthly bank reconciliations take place within two	Monthly bank reconciliations take place within two	Monthly bank reconciliations take place within two	Monthly bank reconciliations take place within two	Monthly bank reconciliations take place within two

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							months after the end of the month. It should be noted that MDAs could score a 'B' under this dimension since they actually complete the reconciliations within a month - the delay is as a result of the dependency on the Treasury	months after the end of the month. It should be noted that MDAs could score a 'B' under this dimension since they actually complete the reconciliations within a month - the delay is as a result of the dependency on the Treasury	months after the end of the month. It should be noted that MDAs could score a 'B' under this dimension since they actually complete the reconciliations within a month - the delay is as a result of the dependency on the Treasury	months after the end of the month. It should be noted that MDAs could score a 'B' under this dimension since they actually complete the reconciliations within a month - the delay is as a result of the dependency on the Treasury	months after the end of the month. It should be noted that MDAs could score a 'B' under this dimension since they actually complete the reconciliations within a month - the delay is as a result of the dependency on the Treasury
PI-22(ii)	Regularity of reconciliation and clearance of suspense accounts and advances	A	A	A	A	A	Advances and suspense accounts are cleared every month and un-acquitted balances charged to affected staff salary account	Advances and suspense accounts are cleared every month and un-acquitted balances charged to affected staff salary account	Advances and suspense accounts are cleared every month and un-acquitted balances charged to affected staff salary account	Advances and suspense accounts are cleared every month and un-acquitted balances charged to affected staff salary account	Advances and suspense accounts are cleared every month and un-acquitted balances charged to affected staff salary account
PI-23	Availability of information on resources received by service delivery units	D	D	D	D	D	No PETS nor PER has been conducted within the last three completed fiscal years. The current accounting system is manual based and would require laborious effort to perform such an	No PETS nor PER has been conducted within the last three completed fiscal years. The current accounting system is manual based and would require laborious effort to perform such an	No PETS nor PER has been conducted within the last three completed fiscal years. The current accounting system is manual based and would require laborious effort to perform such an	No PETS nor PER has been conducted within the last three completed fiscal years. The current accounting system is manual based and would require laborious effort to perform such an	No PETS nor PER has been conducted within the last three completed fiscal years. The current accounting system is manual based and would require laborious effort to perform such an

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE &EA	MoLS MED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							exercise. The expenditure payment system however, when institutionalised would be capable of tracking expenditures of each spending unit	exercise. The expenditure payment system however, when institutionalised would be capable of tracking expenditures of each spending unit	exercise. The expenditure payment system however, when institutionalised would be capable of tracking expenditures of each spending unit	exercise. The expenditure payment system however, when institutionalised would be capable of tracking expenditures of each spending unit	exercise. The expenditure payment system however, when institutionalised would be capable of tracking expenditures of each spending unit
PI-24	Quality and Timeliness of in-year budget reports										
PI-24(i)	Scope of reports in terms of coverage and compatibility with budget estimates	A	A	A	A	A	In-year execution reports are prepared, classified under administrative and economic at both commitment and payment level. These reports are consistent with the original approved budget estimates and consistent over time	In-year execution reports are prepared, classified under administrative and economic at both commitment and payment level. These reports are consistent with the original approved budget estimates and consistent over time	In-year execution reports are prepared, classified under administrative and economic at both commitment and payment level. These reports are consistent with the original approved budget estimates and consistent over time	In-year execution reports are prepared, classified under administrative and economic at both commitment and payment level. These reports are consistent with the original approved budget estimates and consistent over time	In-year execution reports are prepared, classified under administrative and economic at both commitment and payment level. These reports are consistent with the original approved budget estimates and consistent over time
PI-24(ii)	Timeliness of the issue of reports	A	A	A	A	A	Expenditure returns are prepares monthly and completed within two weeks after the end of the month	Expenditure returns are prepares monthly and completed within two weeks after the end of the month	Expenditure returns are prepares monthly and completed within two weeks after the end of the month	Expenditure returns are prepares monthly and completed within two weeks after the end of the month	Expenditure returns are prepares monthly and completed within two weeks after the end of the month

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
PI-24(iii)	Quality of information	A	A	A	A	A	The daily submission of cheque return sheets and the monthly reconciliation process allow for data integrity and accuracy.	The daily submission of cheque return sheets and the monthly reconciliation process allow for data integrity and accuracy.	The daily submission of cheque return sheets and the monthly reconciliation process allow for data integrity and accuracy.	The daily submission of cheque return sheets and the monthly reconciliation process allow for data integrity and accuracy.	The daily submission of cheque return sheets and the monthly reconciliation process allow for data integrity and accuracy.
PI-25	Quality and timeliness of annual financial statements										
PI-25 (i)	Completeness of the financial statements	B	B	B	B	B	An annual financial statement is prepared and submitted to the Auditor General; the statements provide a broad range of financial information on revenue, expenditure, financial assets and liabilities with the exception of a few	An annual financial statement is prepared and submitted to the Auditor General; the statements provide a broad range of financial information on revenue, expenditure, financial assets and liabilities with the exception of a few	An annual financial statement is prepared and submitted to the Auditor General; the statements provide a broad range of financial information on revenue, expenditure, financial assets and liabilities with the exception of a few	An annual financial statement is prepared and submitted to the Auditor General; the statements provide a broad range of financial information on revenue, expenditure, financial assets and liabilities with the exception of a few	An annual financial statement is prepared and submitted to the Auditor General; the statements provide a broad range of financial information on revenue, expenditure, financial assets and liabilities with the exception of a few
PI-25 (ii)	Timeliness of submission of the financial statements	A	A	A	A	A	In all three completed financial years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012, the annual financial	In all three completed financial years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012, the annual financial statements were	In all three completed financial years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012, the annual financial statements were	In all three completed financial years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012, the annual financial	In all three completed financial years 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012, the annual financial statements were

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE &EA	MoLS MED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
							statements were submitted to the Auditor General within 6 months after the end of the financial year	submitted to the Auditor General within 6 months after the end of the financial year	submitted to the Auditor General within 6 months after the end of the financial year	statements were submitted to the Auditor General within 6 months after the end of the financial year	submitted to the Auditor General within 6 months after the end of the financial year
PI-26	Scope, nature and follow-up of external audit										
PI-26(iii)	Evidence of follow up on audit recommendations										
C(iv)	External Scrutiny and Audit										
PI-26	Scope, nature and follow-up of external audit										
PI-26(iii)	Evidence of follow up on audit recommendations	C	C	C	C	C	Even though audit recommendations are made, the delay in PAC's review of Auditor General's reports impedes implementation of recommended actions. There is little evidence of executive follow-up	Even though audit recommendations are made, the delay in PAC's review of Auditor General's reports impedes implementation of recommended actions. There is little evidence of executive follow-up	Even though audit recommendations are made, the delay in PAC's review of Auditor General's reports impedes implementation of recommended actions. There is little evidence of executive follow-up	Even though audit recommendations are made, the delay in PAC's review of Auditor General's reports impedes implementation of recommended actions. There is little evidence of executive follow-up	Even though audit recommendations are made, the delay in PAC's review of Auditor General's reports impedes implementation of recommended actions. There is little evidence of executive follow-up
D.	DONOR PRACTICES										
D-2	Financial information provided by donors for budgeting and reporting on project and program aid										
D-2 (i)	Completeness and timeliness of	D	D	D	D	D	None of the major	None of the major	None of the major	None of the major	None of the major

No.	Indicator	Score 2013					Justification for 2013 score				
		MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP	MoE&WR	MoE&EA	MoLSMED	MoTII	MoFP
	budget estimates by donors for project support						donors provide budget estimates of total project and program aid support	donors provide budget estimates of total project and program aid support	donors provide budget estimates of total project and program aid support	donors provide budget estimates of total project and program aid support	donors provide budget estimates of total project and program aid support
D-2 (ii)	Frequency and coverage of reporting by donors on actual donor flows for project support	D	D	D	D	D	None of the major donors provide financial reports on actual expenditure incurred and paid for projects and program support	None of the major donors provide financial reports on actual expenditure incurred and paid for projects and program support	None of the major donors provide financial reports on actual expenditure incurred and paid for projects and program support	None of the major donors provide financial reports on actual expenditure incurred and paid for projects and program support	None of the major donors provide financial reports on actual expenditure incurred and paid for projects and program support
D-3	Overall proportion of aid funds to central government that are managed through national procedures	A	A	A	A	A	More than 90% of total donor aid to Trinidad and Tobago used country systems. The actual percentage usage was 90.33%, 99.46% and 98.17% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	More than 90% of total donor aid to Trinidad and Tobago used country systems. The actual percentage usage was 90.33%, 99.46% and 98.17% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	More than 90% of total donor aid to Trinidad and Tobago used country systems. The actual percentage usage was 90.33%, 99.46% and 98.17% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	More than 90% of total donor aid to Trinidad and Tobago used country systems. The actual percentage usage was 90.33%, 99.46% and 98.17% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively	More than 90% of total donor aid to Trinidad and Tobago used country systems. The actual percentage usage was 90.33%, 99.46% and 98.17% for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012 respectively

Annex 2: List of Stakeholders Interviewed

Name	Organisation	Position	Email
Ministry of Finance and the Economy			
Eric James	MoFE	Permanent Secretary	jameser@gov.tt
Narine Charran	MoFE	Senior Economist	CharranN@gov.tt
Michelle Durham-Kissoon	MoFE	Assistant Director, Economic Management Division	kissoonM@gov.tt
Roselyn Ramdin-Doobraj	MoFE	Comptroller of Accounts	doobrajr@gov.tt
Narine Charran	MoFE	Senior Economist	charrann@gov.tt
Joycelyn Vialmosa	MoFE	Ag Senior Treasury Accountant	Thomas-vialmosaj@gov.tt
Karen Seeboron-Timothy	MoFE	Ag Treasury Director	Seeboron-timothy@gov.tt
Cherryann Le Gendre	MoFE	Ag Director of Budget	legendrec@gov.tt
Savitree Seepersad	MoFE	Director, Treasury - Pensions Management	seeparsads@gov.tt
Yvonne Neemacharan	MoFE	Director, Treasury Management	neemacharany@gov.tt
Catherine Laban	MoFE	Deputy Comptroller of Accounts	labanca@gov.tt
Yvette Babb	MoFE	Senior Business Analyst	babby@gov.tt
Feroza Matthew	MoFE	Research Officer	matthewf@gov.tt
Eunice Walton	MoFE	Deputy Permanent Secretary	waltone@gov.tt
Denis Cox	MoFE	Senior Investment Analysts	
Board of Inland Revenue			
Errol Ramsubeik	BIR	Ag Commissioner - Legal & Administration	errolramsubeik@yahoo.com
Charles Cudjoe	BIR	Ag Commissioner, Collections and Enforcement	ccudjoe@ird.gov.tt
Nayak Ramdahin	BIR	Commissioner, Audit & Compliance	nnamdahin@ird.gov.tt
Trevor Lalai	BIR	Commissioner, Reform, Objections and Planning	tlalai@ird.gov.tt
Allison Raphael	BIR	Ag Chairman, BIR	araphael@ird.gov.tt
Ministry of Food Production			
Myrna Thompson	MoFP	Permanent Secretary	psmthompson@fp.gov.tt
Yvonne Davidson-Mc Kenzie	MoFP	Director, Planning	YDavidson-McKenzie@fp.gov.tt
Beena Persad	MoFP	Planning Officer II	bpersad@fp.gov.tt
Kamal Ragbir	MoFP	Auditor II	
Geraloine Ferdinand	MoFP	Accounting Executive II	ferinandg@gov.tt
Indra Arjoon	MoFP	Accountant II	
Oswald Wright	MoFP	Project Analyst	owright@gov.tt
Parliament			
Senator Colm Imbert	Parliament	Chairman PAC	colmi@tstt.net.tt
Keiba Jacob	Parliament	Clerk, PAC	kjacob@ttparliament.org
Julien Ogilvie	Parliament	Clerk of Committees	jogilvie@ttparliament.org
Subhass Ramkhe Lawan	Parliament	Chairman, JSC - Municipal Corporation Services	sramkhelawan@stockex.co.tt
Nataki Atiba-Dilchan	Parliament	Clerk to the Senate	natiba@ttparliament.org
Senator Dr. Victor Wheeler	Parliament		wheeler@ttparliament.org
Ministry of Planning and Sustainable Development			
Arlene Mc Comle	MPSD	Permanent Secretary	Arlene.McComle@phe.gov.tt
Samantha Sharma	MPSD	Associate Professional	Samantha.sharma@planning.gov.tt
Marion Lewis	MPSD	Assistant Program Coordinator - EDF Unit	Marion.lewis@planning.gov.tt
Marilyn Joseph	MPSD	Administrative Officer	Marilyn.joseph@planning.gov.tt

Name	Organisation	Position	Email
Marlene Nicholas	MPSD	Administrative Officer	Marlene.nicholas@planning.gov.tt
Zelmina James	MPSD	Auditor II	Zelmina.james@planning.gov.tt
Karlene Roach	MPSD	Director, Planning	Karlene.roach@planning.gov.tt
Joanne Deoraj	MPSD	Assistant Director	Joanne.deoraj@planning.gov.tt
Ayleen Ovid	MPSD	Director	Ayleen.alleyneovid@planning.gov.tt
Ministry of Environment and Water Resources			
David Persand	MoEWR	Environmental Manager	Dvid.persand@gov.tt
Praimatee Chandoo	MoEWR	Administrative Manager	chandoo@gov.tt
Ajodia Rattansingh	MoEWR	Manager, Human Resource	Ajodia.rattansingh@gov.tt
Rhoda Gunnesslal	MoEWR	Ag Accountant II	Rhoda_gunnesslal@live.com
Sara Randass-Maharaj	MoEWR	Ag Clerk II (Payroll)	sarasavitri@yahoo.com
Allan Elder	MoEWR	Ag. Accounting Assistant	Ae4846798@gmail.com
Donors			
Gregory Dunbar	IADB	Financial Expert	gdunbar@iadb.org
Julian Belgrave	IADB	Operations Specialist	julianb@iadb.org
Terhi Karvinen	EU	Program Coordinator	Terhi.karvinen@eeas.europa.eu
Solomon Ioannou	EU	Program Coordinator	Solomon.ioannou@eeas.europa.eu
Lydga Mohammed	EU	Cooperation Assistant	Lydga.Mohammed@eeas.europa.eu
Kathrin Renner	EU	Program Coordinator	Kathrin.renner@eeas.europa.eu
Civil Society Organisations			
Afra Raymond	JCC	President	afra@raymondandpierre.com
Rishi P. A. Dass	TTTI	Member	rpadas@gmail.com
Ronald Ramcharam	TTTI	Director, Treasury	ramfriday@hotmail.com
Lorraine Rostant	TTTI	Director, Communications	lorraine@rostantadvertising.com
Stacey Honore	TTCIC	Trade & Research Economist	shonore@chamber.org.tt
Camille Sear-Carter Wells	TTCIC		csearsells@chamber.org.tt
Jerome Chambers	TTCIC		director@globalforensictt.com
Auditor General's Department			
Sharnan Ottley	AGD	Auditor General	ottleysh@gov.tt
Majeed Ali	AGD	Ag Deputy Auditor General	alimaj@gov.tt
Jaiwantie Ramdass	AGD	Assistant Auditor General	ramdassjai@gov.tt
Gary Peters	AGD	Assistant Auditor General	petersg@gov.tt
Gaitrie Maharaj	AGD	Assistant Auditor General	maharajgai@gov.tt
Lorelly Pujadas	AGD	Assistant Auditor General	pujadasl@gov.tt
Ministry of Labour and Small and Micro Enterprise Development			
Carl Francis	MOLSMED	Permanent Secretary	cfrancis@gov.tt
Allisa Francis	MOLSMED	District Coordinator	Francisa3@gov.tt
Shanmabee Singh Sang	MOLSMED	Director, Research & Planning	sangss@gov.tt
Clement Ragoobar Singh	MOLSMED	Auditor II	ragoobarsinghc@gov.tt
Susan Jaglal-Beharry	MOLSMED	Ag Accounting Executive	jaglala@gov.tt
Michael Gordon	MOLSMED	Manager, Enterprises Development Division	gordonm@gov.tt
Ministry of Education			
Jennifer Daniel	MoE	Permanent Secretary	danieljen@gov.tt
Vidya Rambharose-	MoE	Deputy Permanent Secretary	heeramanv@gov.tt

Name	Organisation	Position	Email
Heeraman			
Chanwati Sookra	MoE	Ag Deputy Permanent Secretary	sookrac@gov.tt
Anjasie Samasoo	MoE	Auditor III	samrooanj@gov.tt
Kristy Mahato Maharaj	MoE	Director, M & E	maharajmak@gov.tt
Lemor Baptiste-Simmons	MoE	Director, Educational Planning	Lesimmons-19@hotmail.com
Central Bank of Trinidad & Tobago			
Marie Borely	CBTT	Chief Financial Officer	mborely@central-bank.org.tt
Christopher Subryan	CBTT	Assistant Manager, Finance & Accounting	csubryan@central-bank.org.tt
Ministry of Trade Industry and Investments			
Joycelyn Hunte	MTII	Ag Permanent Secretary	huntejoy@gov.tt
Sharla Codrington	MTII	M & E Specialist	pinders@gov.tt
Janice Piarris	MTII	M & E Specialist	parrisj@gov.tt
Troy Chuerw	MTII	Senior HR Officer	
Leeza Nondalal	MTII	Ag Accountant II	
Ramzan Hosein	MTII	Coordinator	Hoseinram@gov.tt
Pamela Job	MTII	Administrator	jobp@gov.tt
Brennan Guwin	MTII	M & E Specialist	
Randall Karim	MTII	Director	KarimR@gov.tt
Ministry of Works & Infrastructure			
Isaac James	MoWI	Permanent Secretary	ijames@mowt.gov.tt
Sonia Francis-Yearwood	MoWI	Deputy Permanent Secretary	syearwood@mowt.tt
Marissa Chattergoon	MoWI	Auditor III	mchattergoon@mowt.gov.tt
Parbatu Bachan	MoWI	CAS	pbachan@mowt.gov.tt
Lisa Balkaran	MoWI	CPI	lbalkaran@mowt.gov.tt
Wayne Kuyless	MoWI	Senior Economist	wkoylass@mowt.gov.tt
Kamal Lewis	MoWI	Accountant II	
Ramroop Maharaj	MoWI	Accounting Expert II	
Elizabeth Roach	MoWI	Accounting Executive I	
Ministry of Energy & Energy Affairs			
Selwyn Lashley	MEEA	Ag Permanent Secretary	slasley@energy.gov.tt
Richard Oliver	MEEA	Deputy Permanent Secretary	roliver@energy.gov.tt
Heidi Wong	MEEA	Ag Deputy Permanent Secretary	hwong@energy.gov.tt
Grace Corneal	MEEA	Senior Audit Analyst	gcorneal@energy.gov.tt
Cindy Roopchand	MEEA	Planning Officer	croopchand@energy.gov.tt
Poorandi Ramjitsingh	MEEA	Ag Accountant II	pramjitsingh@energy.gov.tt
Azizah Baksh-Backredee	MEEA	Senior Chemical Engineer	abaksh@energy.gov.tt
Richard Jeremie	MEEA	Chief Technical Officer	rjeremie@energy.gov.tt
Barbara Nelson	MEEA	Auditor II	bnelson@energy.gov.tt
Hazra Parasramsingh	MEEA	Ag Auditor V	hparasramsingh@energy.gov.tt
Marc Rudder	MEEA	Senior Petroleum Engineer	mrudder@energy.gov.tt
Randy Maurice	MEEA	Senior Planning Officer	rmaurice@energy.gov.tt
Monty Beharry	MEEA	Director of Minerals	mbeharry@energy.gov.tt
Centrals Tenders Board			
Shamdaye Singh-Ramdial	CTB	Ag Assistant Director of Contracts	Singh-ramdials@gov.tt
Jenepha Khan	CTB	Ag Assistant Director of Contracts	Jenepha58@yahoo.com
Ministry of Health			
Ramesy Gooster	MoH	Auditor II	r.gooster@yahoo.com

Name	Organisation	Position	Email
Veronica Pedro	MoH	Accounting Executive I	Veronica.pedro@health.gov.tt
Andy Thomas	MoH	Senior Health Economist	Andy.thomas@health.gov.tt
Sarita Ghouralal	MoH	Auditor II	Sarita.ghouralal@health.gov.tt
Dave Francois	MoH	Procurement Specialist	daveftt@gmail.com
Geeta Maharaj	MoH	Director, Finance & Accounts	Geeta.maharaj@health.gov.tt

Annex 3: List of Documents Consulted

Legislation, Regulations

- Constitution of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago 1976 (Amendments to 2007)
- Exchequer and Audit Act (EAA), 1999 + Amendments
- Customs Act 1938 + Amendments to date
- Value Added Tax Act, 1939 + Amendments to date
- Income Tax Act, 1938 + Amendments to 1980
- Central Tenders Board Ordinance
- Central Bank Act
- Appropriations Act 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012

Financing Agreements

- Support to the National Sugar Adaptation Strategy
- Support to Enabling Competitive Business (plus addendum)
- Support to Environmental Governance

Budget and Planning Documents

- Public Sector Investment Programme
- Supplementary Public Sector Investment Programme
- Budget statements of Trinidad & Tobago
- Estimates of Revenue for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012
- Details of Estimates of Expenditure 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012
- Mid Term Policy Framework 2011-2014, National Performance Framework and Annual Performance Report 2012
- Open Budget Index
- Use of contingency fund 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012

Treasury

- Public Accounts of the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago Volumes 1 and 2 for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012

Board of Inland Revenue

- Guidelines relating to discretionary powers of the Commissioner
- Taxpayer information materials

Auditor-General Office

- Auditor General's Reports for 2009/2010, 2010/2011 and 2011/2012
- Capacity assessment of Trinidad & Tobago's Auditor General's Department, November 2011

Central Bank of Trinidad and Tobago

- Central Bank periodic reports on the economy 2009/2010 to 2011/2012

National Assembly

- Standing Orders
- Reports of Public Accounts Committee and Public Accounts (Enterprises) Committee
- Report on the Joint Select Committee of Parliament on legislative proposals to provide public procurement and disposal of public property and the repeal and replacement of the Central Tenders Board Act
- A study of parliamentary scrutiny and existing parliamentary practices in Trinidad & Tobago

Internal Documentation and Log Books

- Budgetary mapping tables
- Monthly expenditure returns
- Internal Audit Plans

- Log of receipt of monthly expenditure returns
- Draft Internal Audit manual from the Comptroller of Accounts
- Accounting Manual 2011
- Copies of the chart of accounts
- Reconciliation sheets for suspense accounts
- Reconciliation sheets for revenue transfers to the Treasury Account
- Sample quarterly request for cash releases
- Sample Cash flow statement
- Sample activity progress report

Other publications

- Trinidad and Tobago, Country Profile 2012, Economist Intelligence Unit
- Strengthening Macro fiscal Capacity and Introducing a Medium Term Framework, IMF 2008-10-14
- Reform of the Public Sector Procurement Regime, Progress Reports
- EU Delegation PFM annual reports
- Status report: PFM reform process by George Bindley-Taylor
- Inception and Governance report with respect to PFM reform consultancy, July 2012 by George Bindley-Taylor
- Integrity Commission Annual Reports
- Heritage & Stabilisation Fund reports
- State Enterprises Performance Monitoring manual
- State Enterprises Investment Programme
- Investment opportunities in Agriculture
- Agric incentive programme
- National Food Production Action Plan 2012-2014
- Trinidad and Tobago Extractive Industries Transparency Initiatives Report 2010/2011

